

AGENDA

**Meeting Outcomes for Londoners
Advisory Group**

Date Wednesday 18 March 2020

Time 2.00pm

**Place Room F, 169 Union Street,
London SE1 0LL**

The Outcomes for Londoners Advisory Group is a subordinate body of the Skills for Londoners Board. Agendas and minutes of the meetings of this Group are published at www.London.gov.uk/Skills-for-Londoners (except in those cases where information may be exempt from disclosure under the Freedom of Information Act). Meetings are not held in public and are only open to those invited to attend by the Chair.

Members:

Angus Knowles-Cutler, Skills for Londoners (SfL) Board Member (Chair)
Arinola Edeh, SfL Board Member
Gerry McDonald, SfL Board Member
Neha Agarwal, HESA
Nigel Ball, University of Oxford
Pat Carvalho, HCUC
Darrell DeSouza, Association of Colleges
Dipa Ganguli, Sutton College
Helen Hammond, Institutes for Adult Learning
John Hitchin, Renaisi
Harminder Matharu, AELP
Kirsty McHugh, Mayor's Fund for London
Alison Navarro, Community Action Sutton
Dianna Neal, London Councils Nominee
Diarmid Swainson, London Councils Nominee
Gill Worgan, West Herts College

1 Introduction and apologies

2 Declarations of Interest

Members to declare any disclosable pecuniary interests which they have in any of the items set out on the agenda and, where applicable, consider if they should withdraw from the discussion or the meeting.

3 Minutes from the previous meeting (pages 3 – 6)

4 Actions arising from previous meetings (pages 7 – 8)

To be presented by Rachel Greenwood, Board Secretary, Skills & Employment.

5 Skills for Londoners governance update (oral update)

To be presented by Rachel Greenwood, Board Secretary, Skills & Employment.

6 Outcomes for Londoners – programme update (pages 9 – 14)

a) Update on progress to date

To be presented by Joel Mullan, Principal Policy Officer, Skills & Employment.

b) Outcomes data analysis update

To be presented by Chris Minter, Senior Policy Officer, Skills & Employment.

7 Emerging findings from the London Learner Survey feasibility study (presentation and workshop)

Workshop session facilitated by Sarah Frankenburg, NatCen.

8 Date of next meeting

Future meetings of the Outcomes for Londoners Advisory Group are subject to confirmation after the Mayor of London and London Assembly elections on 7 May 2020.

9 Any Other Business the Chair Considers Urgent

Contact Officer: Rachel Greenwood, Board Secretary, Skills & Employment

Telephone: 020 7983 4285

Email: Rachel.Greenwood@london.gov.uk

Skills for Londoners Board

MINUTES

Meeting Outcomes for Londoners Advisory Group

Date Friday 20 September 2019

Time 10.00am

**Place Room F, 169 Union Street,
London SE1 0LL**

The Outcomes for Londoners Advisory Group is a subordinate body of the Skills for Londoners Board. Agendas and minutes of the meetings of this Group are published at www.London.gov.uk/Skills-for-Londoners (except in those cases where information may be exempt from disclosure under the Freedom of Information Act). Meetings are not held in public and are only open to those invited to attend by the Chair.

Present:**Members:**

Angus Knowles-Cutler, Skills for Londoners (SfL) Board Member (Chair)
Nigel Ball, University of Oxford
Arinola Edeh, SfL Board Member
Dipa Ganguli, Sutton College
Helen Hammond, Institutes for Adult Learning
Harminder Matharu, Association of Employment and Learning Providers
Gerry McDonald, SfL Board Member
Dianna Neal, London Councils
Diarmid Swainson, representing London Councils

GLA Officers:

Michelle Cuomo Boorer, Assistant Director, Skills and Employment

Lubomira Chirmiciu, Senior Manager – Funding Policy & Systems, Skills & Employment

Claire Sherer, Senior Manager – Programmes & Governance, Skills & Employment (Clerk)

Christopher Minter, Senior Policy Officer, Funding Policy and Systems, Skills & Employment

Joel Mullan, Principal Policy Officer, Skills and Employment

Also in attendance:

Alex Stevenson, Learning and Work Institute

Pat Carvalho, Principal and Chief Executive, Harrow College

1 Introduction and apologies

- 1.1 The Chair welcomed members to the meeting and noted that Darrell DeSouza had stood down from the Group since the last meeting with Pat Carvalho, attending for the first time, due to be appointed in his place.
- 1.2 Apologies for absence were received from Alison Navarro, John Hitchin and Kirsty McHugh.
- 1.3 The Chair then outlined the meeting agenda, noting that by the end of the meeting, it was hoped that the Group would have:
 - discussed and agreed the priority impact areas for the Adult Education Budget (AEB);
 - discussed and provided feedback on the proposed impact measures for each of the outcome areas; and
 - discussed and provided feedback on the proposed approach to improving the data available to measure the impact of the AEB.

2 Declarations of Interest

- 2.1 There were no declarations of interest.

3 Minutes from the previous meeting

3.1 RESOLVED:

The minutes of the meeting held on 6 June 2019 were agreed as a correct record.

4 Actions Arising

- 4.1 There were no outstanding actions arising.

5 Impact Measures research findings (Presentation)

- 5.1 The Chair invited Alex Stevenson from Learning & Work Institute to present to the group on the research and stakeholder engagement that had been taking place over the last seven months to inform the selection of impact measures for the AEB.
- 5.2 In particular, he set out their working hypothesis in relation to enhancing the collection of progression data and establishing a new learner outcomes tool.

5.3 RESOLVED:

That the presentation be noted with discussion to take place under Item 6 below.

6 Update on development of an impact-based funding model for the Adult Education Budget

- 6.1 Officers presented the latest available impact data, and a proposed approach to practically improving the data available. Regarding destinations data, Officers outlined the need to understand what level of analysis was wanted, including the gaps in data and areas which they thought might be of particular interest such as participation gaps amongst men and those with disabilities.
- 6.2 The Chair then invited members of the group to comment on the proposed approach. As a result of the discussion, there was a general consensus that the proposed approach was broadly the right direction of travel and advised that:
- instead of introducing mandatory questions in individual learner surveys, City Hall would be well placed to develop and coordinate a London-wide learner survey;
 - that although the approach was welcome, there would be some practical barriers that the GLA would have to explore further. For example, ILR data would not provide all the information needed to form a holistic view;
 - it may be helpful to divide any survey into core questions and optional questions to ensure all learners feel able to participate;
 - work should be done to look at ways to improve returns. ESOL learners were a particularly difficult group and should be looked at;
 - it would be useful if the GLA could collect and review a wide range of provider learner surveys to help inform a draft survey for consultation. It might also be beneficial to review other surveys e.g. those operated by HESA; and
 - in terms of format, they suggested that the survey should be done on a relatively large scale to ensure that data could be analysed at a local level e.g. by institution, area, levels, sector etc.
- 6.3 One Member noted that it would also be good to explore reasons for non-participation and barriers to accessing learning opportunities.
- 6.4 Officers noted that this was a real opportunity to tailor any approach to London's needs and, by working in collaboration with providers, really demonstrate the benefits of devolution.

6.5 RESOLVED:

The Advisory Group:

- (a) Noted the Learning and Work Institute Report: Development of an Outcome Measures Framework for London's Adult Education Budget;**

Skills for Londoners - Outcomes for Londoners Advisory Group
Friday 20 September 2019
Minutes

- (b) **Noted the update on the development of an impact-based funding model; and**
- (c) **Recommended that City Hall conduct a London-wide learner survey and noted that GLA officers would collect a wide range of provider learner surveys to help inform a draft survey for consultation.**

7 Next Steps

- 7.1 Officers advised Members that Officers would work up plans as per the discussion above for consideration by the Skills for Londoners Board at their meeting on 3 October 2019.

8 Date of Next Meeting

- 8.1 The next meeting of the Outcomes for Londoners Advisory Group would be confirmed at a later date.

9 Any Other Business the Chair Considers Urgent

- 9.1 There was no other business.

10 Close of Meeting

- 10.1 The meeting closed at 11.30am.

Contact Officer: Rachel Greenwood, Board Secretary, Skills & Employment

Telephone: 020 7983 4285

Email: Rachel.Greenwood@london.gov.uk

Skills for Londoners Board Outcomes for Londoners Advisory Group

Date of meeting: **18 March 2020**

Title of report: **Actions Arising from previous meetings**

To be presented by: **Rachel Greenwood, Board Secretary, Skills & Employment**

Cleared by: **Michelle Cuomo Boorer, Assistant Director – Skills & Employment**

Classification **Public**

1 Executive Summary

- 1.1 This report updates the Outcomes for Londoners Advisory Group on actions arising from the previous meeting.

2 Recommendation

- 2.1 The Outcomes for Londoners Advisory Group is asked to **note** the update on actions arising from the previous meeting.

3 Actions arising from the meeting of 20 September 2019

Agenda Item	Action	Status
6. Update on development of an impact-based funding model for the Adult Education Budget	The Group recommended that City Hall conduct a London-wide learner survey and noted that GLA officers would collect a wide range of provider learner surveys to help inform a draft survey for consultation.	A feasibility study for the London Learner Survey is now underway, and an update will be provided at Agenda Item 7.

4 Next Steps

- 4.1 Outlined elsewhere within this report.

Appendices:

- None.

This page is intentionally left blank.

**Skills for Londoners Board
Outcomes for Londoners Advisory Group**

Date of meeting: **18 March 2020**

Title of report: **Outcomes for Londoners – Programme Update**

To be presented by: **Chris Minter, Senior Policy Officer, Funding Policy and Systems**

Cleared by: **Michelle Cuomo Boorer, Assistant Director, Skills & Employment**

Classification: **Public**

1 Executive Summary

- 1.1 This report provides an overview of developments since the last meeting of the Outcomes for Londoners Advisory Group, including outline analysis of Further Education (FE) Outcomes Based Success Measures data, and progress in developing a London Learner Survey.

2 Recommendations

- 2.1 The Outcomes for Londoners Advisory Group is asked to:
- 2.1.1 **Note** the update on progress since the last meeting of the Advisory Group;
 - 2.1.2 **Note** the latest analysis of published Further Education Outcome Based Success Measures data;
 - 2.1.3 **Note** the piloting of new approaches to measuring impact and outcomes through the Skills for Londoners Innovation Fund; and
 - 2.1.4 **Discuss** the emerging findings from the feasibility study for a London Learner Survey (to be presented at the meeting under Agenda Item 7);

3 Introduction and Background

- 3.1 Since the last meeting of the Outcomes for Londoners Advisory Group, the GLA has: commissioned a feasibility study for a potential London Learner Survey; analysed the latest publicly available data on learner destinations; and funded a number of pilot projects through the Skills for Londoners Innovation Fund that will provide insights into how various learner outcomes and impacts can be measured.

4 Issues for Consideration

Agreed Priority Impact Areas for the AEB

- 4.1 At its last meeting in September 2019, the Advisory Group discussed the proposed approach to measuring the impact of the Adult Education Budget (AEB). A revised version of the approach, incorporating feedback from both the Advisory Group and the Skills for Londoners Board was presented to the Mayor at the AEB Mayoral Board in November 2019.
- 4.2 The Mayor agreed that assessment of the impact of the AEB will now be focused on the priority impact areas set out in the table below. These are the areas where there is: strong alignment between the outcomes of adult learning and London's policy priorities; evidence of direct links between participation in adult education and the identified impact area; and support from providers.

Economic Impact (aligned with Mayoral priorities around economic fairness and poverty reduction)	Social Impact
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Progression into employment• In-work progression• Progression into further education and training	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Improvements to health and wellbeing• Improvements to social integration• Improvements to learner self-efficacy• Participation in volunteering

Exploring the feasibility of a London Learner Survey

- 4.3 In line with the advice given by the Advisory Group in September 2019 that the GLA should explore running a central survey as a mechanism to collect outcomes and destination data, the Mayor agreed to commission a survey feasibility study. The study will assess potential operating models for a survey, and identify the cost and resource implications of the various options.
- 4.4 Following a competitive procurement process, NatCen – in partnership with Learning & Work Institute – were appointed to carry out the feasibility study. NatCen are a leading independent social research organisation with extensive experience of major government surveys as well as the Survey of Londoners. They will undertake: a review of information requirements; a methodological review of existing surveys and sample; design the survey content; and make recommendations for the design of the survey.
- 4.5 Emerging findings from the study (including the options under consideration, and the potential trade-offs between scale and cost), will be presented for discussion by the Advisory Group in this meeting.

Further Education (FE) Outcome Based Success Measures

- 4.6 In October 2019, the Department for Education published the annual FE Outcome Based Success Measures dataset. For the first time, this

included a dataset which breaks outcomes down by Mayoral Combined Authority area or equivalent. Headlines from an analysis of this dataset follows below. This provides an overview of employment and further learning outcomes trends over the 2013/14 to 2016/17 academic years.

- 4.7 Overall, sustained employment outcomes have declined (from 56% of learners who achieved their qualifications in 2013/14, to 52% in 2016/17) whilst sustained further learning increased (from 24% in 2013/14 up to 30% of learners who achieved their qualifications in 2016/17). Over this time period, the number of learners (matched to the Longitudinal Educational Outcomes (LEO) data) participating in the AEB has fallen from 250,940 to 140,030, meaning that the AEB is now targeted on a smaller number of learners.
- 4.8 Generally, the higher the level of qualification achieved, the higher the likelihood that a learner will be in sustained employment after completing their course.
- 4.9 Different Sector Subject Areas (SSAs) have their highest sustained employment outcomes at different levels of qualification. For example, health, social care and public service had its highest sustained employment rate of 67% at Level 2; construction and the built environment had its highest sustained employment rate of 89% at Level 3 whilst business, admin and law had its highest sustained employment rate of 91% at Level 4. However, this does not take into account factors that might affect sustained employment, including whether the learner was already in employment before the course and the number of achievements at different levels.
- 4.10 The data suggests that progression routes to higher levels of learning are not as effective as they could be. Of the 83,590 learners completing an entry level or Level 1 qualification in 2016/17 more than a quarter (23,987) were retained in sustained further education and this rises to 39% for those studying English for speakers of other languages (ESOL) courses. However only 1% of these learners progressed to Level 2 qualifications. Over the three academic years from 2013/14 to 2016/17, progression from Level 2 courses to Level 3 was very low. In 2016/17 this was as low as 2% of Level 2 learners overall, with an exception being progression from Full Level 2 courses to Full Level 3 courses, which was at 12%. This needs further detailed analysis which will require access to the LEO data.
- 4.11 There are significant limitations to the data contained in the published FE Outcomes dataset. At a London level it is not possible to cut the data by provider; by learning aim; by funding type or by ethnicity. Moreover, it is not possible to control for the level of qualification achieved by learners prior to entering into their course of learning. The GLA is working to obtain access to the full LEO dataset in order to fully understand the impact of the AEB on learner employment and progression outcomes.

Skills for Londoners Innovation Fund

- 4.12 Through the Skills for Londoners Innovation Fund, the Mayor has invested more than £7m of London's AEB allocation for 2019/20 on projects that meet the Mayor's priorities for education and skills in London, demonstrate innovation and deliver tangible outcomes. All projects being supported through the Fund will be robustly evaluated.

- 4.13 Through the Fund, the GLA is testing different approaches to the measurement of impact and outcomes. From our initial analysis the main employment and social outcomes which will be delivered are: in progression into employment/ further learning; work readiness; digital inclusion; self-efficacy and social integration.
- 4.14 A number of projects are testing differing approaches to measuring outcomes, that are of particular relevance to this group. Most notably, three projects are trialling varied approaches to measuring social integration. One college is using a selection of engagement metrics, looking at: who and how often learners go to healthcare/other professionals for support; whether they volunteer and participate in community and school events (including parents' evenings); and whether they attend social events and mix outside their socioeconomic, ethnic, gender or age groups. An Institute for Adult Learning is using an Attitudes Survey to measure key aspects of the learner's ability to understand life in the UK, and their 'integration' progress using 13 questions across three themes. In contrast, one local authority provider will be using the Home Office Indicators of Integration Framework.

5 Equality comments

- 5.1 In the Skills for Londoners Strategy and subsequent analyses, the GLA has highlighted that there are several groups that are disproportionately underrepresented in London's labour market, including some groups with protected characteristics. This includes special educational needs and disabilities (SEND) learners, young people, disabled adults, Black, Asian and minority ethnic (BAME) groups and women.
- 5.2 The GLA will use any data collected through the London Learner Survey to measure and analyse trends in the participation of different groups of Londoners and the outcomes achieved by different groups of Londoners. This will give the GLA insight into how effectively providers are serving those groups, and will be used to inform future policy interventions to reduce gaps in participation and achievement among disadvantaged groups. Officers have considered the direct impact of the proposed work on groups with protected characteristics and do not anticipate that the collection of survey data, in and of itself, will disadvantage any particular group.
- 5.3 The public sector equality duty has been taken into account in ensuring that the feasibility study for the London Learner Survey enables all those with protected characteristics to take part in the survey. It has been considered in the selection of evaluators and projects for the Innovation Fund.

6 Risks arising / mitigation

- 6.1 Undertaking a feasibility study will mitigate risks involved in the implementation of a London wide survey of learners. Access to the LEO data will mitigate risks by improving the accuracy and scope of our data leading to greater understanding.

7 Legal Comments

- 7.1 Should any legal queries arise from the considerations set out in this report, the GLA will contact TfL Legal to obtain advice.

8 Financial Comments of the Executive Director Resources

- 8.1 There are no direct financial implications to the GLA arising from the considerations set out in this report.

9 Next steps

- 9.1 The next steps following consideration by the Advisory Group are summarised below:

Activity	Timeline
Learner Survey	
Detailed proposal for London Learner Survey – including resources required – brought to the AEB Mayoral Board for consideration	Summer 2020
FE Outcomes Administrative data	
Lobby government for access to LEO data FE Outcomes data for 2018/19 available	Ongoing November 2020
Skills for Londoners Innovation Fund	
Initial report of findings from the evaluators will be available	Autumn 2020
Final report on the Innovation Fund evaluation	Autumn 2021

Appendices:

None

Background Documents:

The following documents are available upon request:

- Skills for Londoners Innovation Fund Prospectus
- Feasibility Study Specification

This page is intentionally left blank.