

London Assembly Economy Committee

National, EU & International Literature Review: adult careers information, advice and guidance

Dr Deirdre Hughes, OBE
Director, DMH Associates
& Associate Fellow,
Warwick Institute for Employment Research (IER)

March 2013



CONTENTS

Executive Summary.....	2-3
Acknowledgements.....	4
1.0 Introduction.....	5-10
2.0 Characteristics of high quality, evidence-based adult careers IAG services.....	11-15
3.0 Targeting specific groups.....	16
3.1 People returning to work after absence (including maternity leave.....	16-17
3.2 Mid career changers.....	17-20 20-23
3.3 People aged 50+.....	23-25
3.4 Unemployed adults.....	25
3.5 Careers services for disabled people.....	25-28
3.6 Black, Asian and ethnic minorities.....	
4.0 Other selected examples of good and interesting careers policies and practices.....	29-30
5.0 Conclusions.....	31-32
Appendix 1 – Key Expert Informants.....	33-34
Appendix 2 – UKCES main characteristics of effective ICT approaches.....	35

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of this study is to review evidence from the UK, EU and other international countries of models of interesting policies and practices to inform an effective approach to adult IAG design and delivery for London and to offer potential evidence based policy options for consideration by the London Assembly Economy Committee. Eight key themes were identified by the Committee along with a focus on six specific target groups: people returning to work after an absence from the labour market (e.g. through caring or maternity); mid career changers; people aged 50+; those at risk of long term unemployment; disabled people and people from black, Asian and minority ethnic communities.

The study revealed there is a lack of academic literature on the impact of sustained adult guidance in city-wide initiatives mainly due to lack of recorded data for various reasons including a fragmentation of services, a dearth of longitudinal studies on impact initiatives or few or no tracking systems by employers monitoring low skilled worker participation. Examples reported within this study are generally regarded by experts within the field as being worthy of consideration even though some are currently work in progress.

Evidence has been drawn from policy reviews carried out in the last decade by the OECD; World Bank and the European Commission and agencies, in total encompassing over 55 countries. Examples of good and interesting policies and practices are identified from more than one hundred evidence sources, followed by up to fifty illustrations highlighted in the report. The conclusions highlight:

A 'one-size fits all approach' to adult guidance services is undesirable, ineffective and likely to be costly for individuals, employers and governments. The available research evidence highlights how adult guidance strategies in most major cities in the UK (and further afield) are often fragmented and diffuse. Allowing a diverse range of services to be provided throughout the lifespan within one organisational system framework is potentially: more cost-effective; avoids unnecessary duplication of resources and age-segmented services; and provides potential opportunities for inter-generational learning.

Shifts towards more localised provision such as Local Enterprise Partnerships (LEPs) highlight the necessity of both a National Careers Framework, supported by local partnership approaches to reduce confusion and duplication in training and resources, especially labour market information (LMI) and ICT developments, and to raise quality standards. A London-wide Careers Strategic Steering Group could assist the Greater London Authority (GLA) and London Enterprise Panel (LEP) in their employer engagement and industrial strategy plans, similar to that adopted in Northern Ireland and forthcoming strategic arrangements in Wales.

Given the sheer size of London and its sub-regions a mixed model of high street shop-front services, online and outreach community-provision is highly relevant, combining best practice from Northern Ireland, Wales, Scotland, New Zealand and British Columbia. The latter offers an opportunity to further strengthen closer working links between Jobcentre Plus and the National Careers Service using new approaches to e-coaching and e-guidance.

The brand and visibility of adult guidance services (and young people's services) could be further enhanced through a targeted campaign using multi-media channels, similar to the earlier Learndirect approach. There is also scope to consider lessons learned from the Maldives regarding an innovative approach to careers services. In

addition, all users need clarity on their entitlements – where they can get what, and from whom.

The need for the use of high quality, integrated ICT based delivery of careers services; and secondly, the importance of high quality, impartial LMI in careers practice. Both findings have implications for capacity building within and across the careers workforce, as well as the development of a robust technology infrastructure to deliver online services. The example from British Columbia, Canada, is worthy of special note regarding the integrated online services, providing a template for delivery, moving forward. Regarding the use of LMI, the research being sponsored by the UK Commission for Employment and Skills, promises a breakthrough in accessibility to high quality, robust LMI databases for careers guidance. There is scope for a steer to be provided by the Economy Committee in the exploitation of this web tool, which is due for stage one release at the end of May 2013.

There is a need for targeted support for groups identified by the Committee including the 50+, low paid workers and parents (including those returning to work and lone parents). Research findings on careers guidance services for disabled people are generally minimalist. Examples of practice in this paper provide concrete examples of how these groups' needs can be better met. Careers services should be allowed the flexibility to innovate and develop more effective and personalised services beyond a narrow set of key performance indicators.

Findings from the Careers Profession Taskforce in England (2011) provide a framework for strengthening the careers profession and capacity building within local communities across London. There is a case for London to promote quality standards around levels of qualification of career practitioners and continuing professional development requirements. The formation of a new Career Development Institute, bringing together four long standing professional associations from public, private and voluntary/community sectors, creates a new opportunity for greater capacity building of career development practitioners and allied workers across London.

The existing requirement to meet the matrix Standard for adult careers IAG currently applies to all NCS prime and sub-contractors. It needs to be established as a more prominent benchmark, possibly alongside other quality kitemarks to encourage private providers to engage with quality assurance and thereby build consumer confidence in the services offered.

There are few robust studies of evidence on city-wide initiatives to enable concrete conclusions to be drawn on the impact of different models and approaches on adults' attainment, progression and employment prospects, or on other quantifiable success measures. However, there is evidence elsewhere to demonstrate a relationship between clarity of career goals and educational attainment. There is also a strong theoretical basis for the effect of careers education and guidance on attainment and associated behaviour. This is supported by some US studies on the impact of more broadly-based guidance programmes on pupil performance.

The ongoing work of the International Centre for Career Development and Public Policy (ICCDPP), PES to PES (public employment service) dialogue, the European Lifelong Guidance Policy Network (ELGPN), and Cedefop provide further strong insights to progress being made on career development systems and services and future prospects.

Acknowledgements

Special thanks to Simon Shaw, Assistant Scrutiny Manager, and Richard Berry, Scrutiny Manager, London Assembly Secretariat, for their invaluable guidance and support.

I am also greatly indebted to Professor Jenny Bimrose, Deputy Director, Warwick Institute for Employment Research (IER) who acted as critical reader and specialist adviser on careers work, gender, ICT and labour market intelligence issues. I would also like to thank Brenda Cabras, Prospects, London and Joe Billington, Head of the National Careers Service in England, and international expert informants who contributed to this study by giving freely their time and expertise. Whilst the author has tried to do justice to the wealth of general and stand alone data available but, inevitably, it was not possible to be able to include everything. Finally, thank you to members of the London Assembly Economy Committee for their work in raising the visibility and impact of careers services for adults across London.

1. Introduction

1.1 The aims of this paper are two-fold:

- To review evidence from UK, EU and international models of good and/or interesting policies and practices in order to improve understanding of effective approaches to adult careers IAG design and delivery for London.
- To offer potential evidence-based adult careers information, advice and guidance (IAG) policy options for more detailed consideration by the London Assembly Economy Committee.

These will be covered sequentially, followed by conclusions from the study.

1.2. Initially, the concept of 'an all-age careers service' is considered. The paper examines challenges to the implementation of high quality careers guidance services and highlights criteria for judging effective career services. A specific focus on adult guidance careers IAG provision and a discussion of key barriers confronted by particular adult groups is presented, together with an overview of policies in action.

1.3 The paper is informed by a range of policy reviews carried out within the last decade by the OECD¹, World Bank², European Commission³ and its agencies, international bodies⁴ and other organisations, which together have covered a total of at least 55 countries. It also draws on an extensive range of academic published papers and up-to-date information from expert informants on a global basis (see *Appendix 1*).

1.4. The specific focus is on adult guidance IAG models that target specific groups (though these are not necessarily mutually exclusive) including: people returning to work after an absence from the labour market (including maternity leave); mid-career changers; people aged 50+; people in low paid work, those at risk of long-term unemployment; disabled people; and people from black, Asian and minority ethnic communities.

1.5 There are difficulties associated with drawing clear distinctions between and amongst these various groups, given the unifying elements that affect all adults regardless of their social class, age, gender, and ethnicity.⁵

1.6. Key themes were identified by the Economy Committee as specific areas of interest, including: (i) differing forms of public-private-third sector social partnerships; (ii) harnessing knowledge from other sectors e.g. social and community enterprises, co-funded alliances, further and higher education, and community adult initiatives; (iii) local activism and local services; (iv) use of the internet and telephone helplines; (v) labour market information and intelligence (LMI); (vi) branding and marketing adult

¹ Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (2004). *Career Guidance and Public Policy: Bridging the Gap*. Paris: OECD. Sultana, R.G. (2004). *Guidance Policies in the Knowledge Society*. Cedefop

Panorama Series 85. Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities.

² Watts, A.G. and Fretwell, D. (2004) *Public Policies for Career Development: Case Studies And Emerging Issues For Designing Career Information And Guidance Systems In Developing And Transition Economies*. Washington, DC: World Bank.

³ http://ec.europa.eu/index_en.htm and Cedefop (2005). *Improving Lifelong Guidance Policies and Systems: Using Common European Reference Tools*. Thessaloniki: Cedefop.

⁴ <http://www.iccdpp.org/>

⁵ Hughes, D.M. (2010). *A Literature review: Social Mobility and Careers Service Provision in England*. London: Careers England.

careers IAG; (vii) workforce development; and (viii) career management and career adaptability blueprints.

1.7. A lack of academic literature on the impact of sustained adult guidance city-wide initiatives, partly due to fragmentation of services and dearth of longitudinal impact studies, is inevitably reflected in this paper. Also, few employers maintain tracking systems specifically to monitor participation of low skilled and/or low paid workers. Evidence also suggests that employers more generally need to be made aware of the processes and benefits associated with career guidance. Some examples outlined below are, therefore, work in progress but have been included because they are regarded by expert informants as worthy of consideration by the Committee. In addition, research findings on adult guidance city initiatives from the National Careers Service (NCS) in England are not yet in the public domain⁶. This may be redressed when the National Careers Council's report to Government is submitted in May 2013.

1.8 Findings from this study strongly indicate that the fundamental characteristics, remit, and structure of a vibrant well functioning adult guidance careers service for Londoners should be part of *an all-age careers service* for consideration by the London Assembly's Economy Committee. In particular, lessons learned from other cities and countries are of critical relevance. The OECD Career Guidance Policy Review (2004)⁷ suggests that allowing a diverse range of services to be provided throughout the lifespan within one organisational system framework is potentially: more cost-effective, avoids unnecessary duplication of resources and age-segmented services; and provides potential opportunities for inter-generational learning. Watts (2005; 2007; 2009)⁸ benchmarked against the OECD review three major examples of all-age services – in New Zealand, Scotland and Wales – which highlighted positive results. In effect, 'such a service provides a strong professional spine for a lifelong careers guidance system' (Watts, 2010⁹; Watts, 2012)¹⁰. Four contrasting examples of careers guidance systems outside of the UK are outlined below.

Case Study 1: Citizens' right to lifelong guidance in France

Since 2009, a French law has established for every citizen a right to benefit from lifelong guidance, including career information. This law set up an inter-ministerial delegate, reporting to the Prime Minister, on educational and career guidance. The delegate's role is to co-ordinate the actions of the educational services, student services, employment services, and youth and vocational training services. It includes: setting priorities regarding national policies on career information and on educational and career guidance; setting quality standards; co-ordinating policies at regional level. Three main policies are promoted:

⁶ Officially confirmed by the Skills Funding Agency (SFA) and the Department for Business Innovation and Skills correspondence dated:3/3/13

⁷ Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (2004). *Career Guidance and Public Policy: Bridging the Gap*, p.144. Paris: OECD.

⁸ Watts, A.G. (2005). *Progress and Potential*. Glasgow: Careers Scotland. Watts, A.G. (2007). *Career Services: a Review in an International Perspective*. Wellington, New Zealand: Career Services. Watts, A.G. (2009). *Careers Wales: a Review in an International Perspective*. Cardiff: Welsh Assembly Government.

⁹ Watts, A.G. (2010). National all-age career guidance services: evidence and issues. *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling*, 38(1), 31-44.

¹⁰ Watts, A.G. (2012) International Evidence report for DfE – unpublished.

- The awarding of a quality label 'guidance for all' (*orientation pour tous*) to organisations or agencies which are capable of providing individual counselling and have agreed to work as a co-ordinated network.
- A free online service (www.orientation-pourtous.fr) which includes 200,000 files on training, more than 1,000 on qualifications, and more than 2,000 on employment. It also lists all guidance services which have been awarded the quality label.
- A national telephone line which provides free information and support on educational and career guidance. When the telephone practitioner is not able to answer a question, the call is transferred to a relevant counsellor.

Source: ELGPN (2012:20)¹¹

Case Study 2: Development of the Hungarian lifelong guidance system

With EU funding, the systematic development of the Hungarian lifelong guidance system started in 2008 under the Social Renewal Operative Programme, led by the Public Employment Service. The first phase ended in June 2011, and included:

- Building a core network of lifelong guidance professionals, with a unified protocol and a newly developed national competency matrix.
- Building a wider lifelong guidance delivery network (including teachers, social workers and other professionals).
- Creating a new web portal, including films and folders about occupations, a wide range of self assessment questionnaires (on skills, interests, values, work preferences, etc.), an extended range of databases covering all sectors of education, training and employment opportunities, and a virtual community of career guidance professionals.
- Providing support for 83 people to commence master's level studies in career guidance, in two universities.
- Short courses for teachers, social workers and others to train them in basic career guidance skills, drawing from a ten-module programme developed for this purpose (with 2,000 participants).
- Developments through the National Lifelong Guidance Council in relation to: legal regulation of career orientation; impact and cost effectiveness of lifelong guidance; developing performance indicators for lifelong guidance; and user perceptions of career guidance services.

Source: ELGPN (2012:19)¹²

Case study 3: South Korea

In South Korea, *career education is divided into services for youth and adults*. Within schools, careers education is subdivided into guidance and work-based learning through subjects or curriculum programs and extracurricular activities. The relevance of this for adult guidance is linked to individual and parental awareness of labour market opportunities. The Korean Government, in partnership with major industries, developed an incredible work experience theme park called '*Job World*'.¹³ The aim of this facility is to help young people (and their parents) experience various jobs and encourage them to pursue various pathways to their future career. JobWorld is a 200 million-

¹¹ http://ktl.jyu.fi/img/portal/23229/ELGPN_resource_kit_2011-12_web.pdf?cs=1350649791

¹² Op.cit.

¹³ Korea JobWorld, a public institution under the Ministry of Employment and Labor of the Republic of Korea, was opened 15 May 2012.

dollar building that receives 1.2 million visitors per year. It has a job exhibition hall describing the history of work; a career planning hall; and a range of fully developed rooms that replicate various occupations across all levels. There are 37 rooms for primary school aged children (and parents) that enable them to explore 44 different job roles in a range of work places such as a hair salon, operating room, construction site and a space centre. A career guidance counsellor system has been introduced. About 3000 career counsellors have been placed at middle and high schools since the start of training in 2010. About 5000 career counsellors will be appointed by the Government in 2013. In addition, Korean career education will be further organised and systematised by setting national career education goals and achievement standards. It is an extraordinary investment. Every career counsellor will have completed 600 hours of training prior to commencement.

Source: Expert Informant, Tasmania (2013)¹⁴

Case study 4: Denmark All-Age National Guidance Portal

In Denmark, the Ministry of Children & Education has recently overseen the management and delivery¹⁵ of an all-age National Guidance Portal 'UddannelsesGuiden'¹⁶. This has been described as an electronic career index with a number of extra self assessment and skills health check tools and simple interest inventory. Alongside this initiative, an 'e-guidance centre' was launched within the Ministry in January 2011 to service the needs of young people, adults, parents, schools, colleges, training providers and employers. The centre is managed directly by the Ministry for Children & Education. There are 11 full-time equivalent careers practitioners in the Ministry and 40 part-time practitioners employed in e-guidance. Their work is also linked directly to the Youth Guidance and/or Regional Guidance Centres focusing mainly on targeted provision. A professional development section is available on the website for guidance practitioners working with young people and adults ('eVejledning'). eVejledning is platform for chat, telephone & email guidance.

Source: ELGPN (2013:39)¹⁷

1.9 There is an urgent imperative in all countries to secure an appropriate balance between providing core services to all (avoiding 'marginalising the mainstream') and targeting intensive services to those who need them most. Given careers guidance policies and provision are located within and across a range of sectors (e.g. schools, vocational education and training, higher education, adult education, and employment) services to individuals need to be as seamless as possible.

1.10 In England, the Coalition Government's vision for a better quality all-age National Careers Service (NCS) was outlined on 1st December 2011¹⁸. This was

¹⁴ See Appendix 1

¹⁵ The previous Conservative government committed an investment of 50m Danish krone (that is, 10m krone as an annual investment over a 5 year period) on the national portal, but with no dedicated marketing budget. Instead, careers practitioners have promoted the use of the portal in classrooms and within their day-to-day practice.

¹⁶ www.ug.dk

¹⁷ Op cit.

¹⁸ BIS (2011) *New Challenges, New Chances: Further Education and Skills System Reform Plan* London: Department for Business, Innovation & Skills pp.7-8

followed by a more detailed blueprint launched as part of the new National Careers Service on 5th April 2012¹⁹. Complementary structural frameworks emerging in each of the four home nations (and further afield), also offer a rich basis for relevant policies and evidence-based practice to be considered.

1.11 Across London, it is important to develop strategies that will help make good quality careers provision accessible to all whilst reducing unnecessary confusion and wasteful duplication. The OECD (2010)²⁰ indicates that many governments are increasingly using private and non-profit entities to provide goods and services to citizens. With pressures on the public purse, an ageing society and the need to stimulate greater investments and added value returns for participation in learning and work, innovative and creative new approaches are required. Clearly the recent empowerment of Local Enterprise Partnerships (LEPs) to drive forward growth in their local areas and the future role of the NCS is significant in this regard.

1.12 The OECD (2004) noted that ‘the merits of policy strategies that work through community-based organisations include not only their greater knowledge of, and acceptability to, particular client groups, but also the contribution they can make to community capacity building’. On the other hand, it pointed out that ‘others take the view that this sector is fragmented, idiosyncratic, and sometimes anti-government and anti-bureaucratic, and that it too often consumes public funds without discernible outcomes’. It accordingly concluded that such organisations ‘have a contribution to make to career guidance strategies for adults, but alongside – rather than as a substitute for – more formal services’.²¹

1.13 European and UK evidence relating to the main challenges for developing an all-age (including adult guidance specific) system and services include:

- a lack of coordination between education and employment sectors;
- numerous providers with diverse guidance practices;
- allocation of funding, expertise/professionalism of careers practitioners;
- a limited evidence-base for assessing the impact of guidance services; and
- ‘silo’ policy areas (Cedefop, 2011)²².

1.14 Organisational splits between educational guidance and career guidance are also subject to strong criticism (e.g. Leitch Report)²³ because provision then ‘fails to integrate advice on learning with careers advice’, and provides skills advice ‘out of the context of building a career’. Further evidence suggests providing career guidance to adults is just as essential as for youth, but may require a different

¹⁹ BIS (2012) *National Careers Service: The Right Advice At The Right Time - New Challenges, New Chances: Further Education and Skills System Reform Plan*. London: Department for Business, Innovation & Skills

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/32344/12-677-national-careers-service-right-advice-right-time.pdf

²⁰ OECD (2010). *Restoring Fiscal Stability and Lessons for the Public Sector*. Paris: OECD.

²¹ OECD (2004). *Op. cit.*, p.65.

²² BIS (2011) *New Challenges, New Chances: Further Education and Skills System Reform Plan* London: Department for Business, Innovation & Skills pp.7-8

²³ BIS (2012) *National Careers Service: The Right Advice At The Right Time - New Challenges, New Chances: Further Education and Skills System Reform Plan*. London: Department for Business, Innovation & Skills

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/32344/12-677-national-careers-service-right-advice-right-time.pdf

²² Cedefop (2011) *Working and ageing: guidance and counselling for mature learners*. Greece: Thessaloniki. http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/EN/Files/3062_en.pdf

²³ Leitch Review of Skills (2006). *Prosperity for All in the Global Economy – World Class Skills*, pp.109, 129. London: The Stationery Office.

approach and technique, and as much (if not more) expert direction (Hutchinson & Jackson, 2007)²⁴.

1.15 Access to career guidance services for adults at times of transition is crucial for positive outcomes both for the individual and smooth functioning of the labour market (Brown and Bimrose, 2012)²⁵. Some argue for change in transition points to take account of demographic shifts (Schuller & Watson, 2009)²⁶ focusing on those up to 25, 25–50, 50–75, 75+. This is contested territory, for example, the UK Commission on Employment and Skills (UKCES, 2012)²⁷ highlights the need to create more career opportunities for young people given this group have suffered disproportionately in the current economic downturn. A recent Education Select Committee Inquiry into careers education for young people²⁸ also makes a case for greater investment by Government in this regard. In Europe changes in legislation, regulation and statutory provisions in career guidance highlight differing accountability and reporting mechanisms (Hughes, 2012a)²⁹.

²⁴ http://www.derby.ac.uk/files/iag_review_2007.pdf

²⁵ Brown, A. and Bimrose, J. (2012) 'Role of vocational training and learning at work in individual career development across the life-course: examples from across Europe', in *Beruflichkeit zwischen institutionellem Wandel und biographischem Projekt*, (*Bildung und Arbeit series*), (German Edition), [Professionalism between institutional change and biographical project], 167- 188, Editors: A. Bolder, R. Dobischat, G. Kutscha, & G. Reutter, G., Wiesbaden: Springer

²⁶ Schuller, T. & Watson, D. (2009) *Learning Through Life Inquiry into the Future of Lifelong Learning Summary*. Leicester: National Institute for Adult Continuing Education (NIACE)

²⁷ <http://www.ukces.org.uk/assets/ukces/docs/publications/the-youth-employment-challenge.pdf>

²⁸ <http://www.parliament.uk/business/committees/committees-a-z/commons-select/education-committee/news/substantive-careers-guidance/>

²⁹ Hughes, D. (2012a) *Improving Lifelong Career Guidance and ICT Support project: The establishment and operation of National Fora for Career Guidance*. Croatia: Public Employment Service and Tribal Education Ltd. Retrieved on 15/11/12:
http://ktl.jyu.fi/img/portal/10954/A3_9_Statutory_Provisions_Paper_140412.pdf?cs=1346413846

2.0 Characteristics of high quality, evidence-based adult careers IAG services

2.1 A broad perspective of 'adult careers guidance' is used throughout this paper. The term 'career' is described as "an evolving sequence of person's work experience over time"³⁰. Career information, advice and guidance, career management skills, employability, career adaptability and resilience competences are key words often used interchangeably in both education and employment sectors operating in differing contexts and settings. Career guidance can perform a valuable role in raising the aspirations of individuals in poverty and low income and those disadvantaged by making them aware of opportunities, and supporting them in securing entry to such opportunities.

2.2 Career guidance services also support economic efficiency, make the labour market operate more effectively by reducing drop-outs from education and training, mismatches in supply and demand, and reduces market failure by helping ensure that individuals maximise their talents. These services also promote social equality and inclusion, and access to educational and labour market opportunities. The recent Heseltine Review (2012)³¹ argues that:

'One of the most oft-repeated, but also most frequently ignored recommendations in the field of UK vocational education and training (VET) over the last 30 years has been the need for more and better careers information, advice and guidance.'

(Keep, quoted in the Heseltine Review: 22)

2.3 Findings from an International Symposium on 'Career Development and Public Policy (2011)³² highlight the necessity to link the role of *career development systems and services* more strongly to policy priorities. It is therefore important to improve national, regional and local visibility of careers services in a coherent approach to social inclusion, active citizenship, lifelong learning, full employment, as well as future skills and qualifications. The OECD indicates:-

'When it cannot be readily identified as a service that is available in its own right, people will continue to have difficulty accessing it.' (p.102³³)

2.4 Broad characteristics of effective career development policy and practice features include provision in the public, private and voluntary and community sectors. These features are specifically linked to all-age and lifelong guidance policies that include four themes: (i) access to services for all citizens; (ii) career management skills; (iii) quality assurance and evidence of provision; and (iv) co-operation and communication between and across differing key agencies³⁴.

³⁰ Arthur et al. (1996). *The Boundaryless Career: A New Employment Principle for a New Organizational Era: A New Employment Principle for a New Organizational Era*. Oxford University Press.

³¹ Heseltine Review (2012) *No Stone Unturned in Pursuit of Growth*, The Rt Hon. The Lord Heseltine of Thenford CH, London: Department for Business, Innovation & Skills, October 2012.

³² Sixth International Symposium on Career Development and Public Policy (Budapest, 5-7 December 2011) – COMMUNIQUE

³³ Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (2004) *Career Guidance and Public Policy: Bridging the Gap*, Paris: OECD.

³⁴ A set of detailed aims, principles and key characteristics of lifelong guidance are outlined in detail within the European Lifelong Guidance Policy Development: A European Resource Kit (2012) http://ktl.jyu.fi/img/portal/23229/ELGPN_resource_kit_2011-12_web.pdf?cs=1350649791

2.5 The UKCES (2011)³⁵ published a series of expert papers on careers guidance provision, drawing on national, EU and international exemplars (particularly in relation to the use of ICT in careers work) – see Appendix 2. The extended use of technologies has combined with other factors, such as changes in consumer behaviours and the availability of more ‘open source’ data, resulted in profound shifts in how individuals utilise services in a rapidly changing world.

2.5.1 In England, a UKCES funded ‘LMI for All’ initiative will create a national and regional open source data tool to bring together existing sources of labour market information (LMI) that can inform people’s decisions about their careers. The outcome will not be a new website for individuals to access but a tool that seeks to make the data freely available and to encourage open use by applications and websites which can bring the data to life for varying audiences³⁶.

2.5.2 In Scotland, Northern Ireland and Wales, there is a formal ‘Concordat’ between their national careers services and Warwick Institute for Employment Research (IER), to support the sharing and development of labour market intelligence and information for training careers practitioners and allied workers. This is viewed by policy-makers and heads of careers services as a means of improving the quantity, quality and impact of LMI for the benefit of individuals, the economy and as a means of driving down costs. The National Careers Service in England is currently creating its own LMI training module.

2.5.3 In Sweden, a European Social Funds programme (2012-2014) aims to develop career counselors’ knowledge of the regional labour market and businesses, and create networking with industrial sectors³⁷. The Regional Council of southern Småland established this guidance and counseling project to improve the skills of all guidance counselors working in elementary schools, universities and community settings (both private and public employment services counselors are included). Around 300 counselors are involved in this venture from the regions of Småland, Kalmar, Jönköping, Gotland and Blekinge. Plans are underway to implement training programmes that match the target group’s needs, as identified early on in the development phase, with skills training for networking and interacting with industry. The development of skills is intended to have a direct effect on the guidance and ultimately equip individuals with more informed education and career choices. A key aim is to create collaboration between guidance practitioners in different industrial areas in the region.

2.5.4 In Canada, the Government has recently funded a substantial impact research study into the use of labour market information (LMI) in practice. Early results indicate that LMI interventions delivered individually, or in groups, can increase the probability of finding employment. LMI also has a positive impact on intermediate outcomes such as, skills and knowledge in the acquisition and use of LMI, together with the level of self-efficacy and confidence in undertaking job search and career decision-making activities³⁸. One other relevant finding from the Canadian research relates to how web-based LMI, related to career planning, can make a positive contribution to achieving intermediate outcomes and is effective in

35 <http://www.ukces.org.uk/assets/ukces/docs/publications/helping-individuals-succeed-transforming-career-guidance.pdf>

36 <http://www.ukces.org.uk/ourwork/research/lmi/lmi-4-all>

37 Details provided by Expert Informant - Euroguidance Sweden – see Appendix 1

38 Canadian Career Development Foundation & Canadian Research Working Group for Evidence-based Practice in Career Development (2011) *Measuring the Impact of Labour Market Information on Career Decision-Making and Job Search*. CRWG.
<http://www.crwg-drc.ca/crwg/index.php/research-projects/lm>

empowering clients to take the next steps in achieving their career goals - ultimately leading to a better job outcome³⁹.

2.6 Growing concerns about supply and demand are linked not only to mismatch or shortfall in skills, but also to poor careers advice in schools (Mann, 2012; UKCES & EETF, 2013)⁴⁰. This has implications for individuals and families who receive mixed messages about labour market opportunities and the relevance of learning and work. As a result, the training of careers practitioners and allied workers communicating clear LMI to parents and families is a key priority that merits urgent attention. The Canadian Career Development Foundation (CCDF) offers targeted parent workshops and seminars on how the world of work has changed over the last decade.

2.7 As part of the New Agenda for Adult Learning, the European Commission (2013)⁴¹ is paying attention to the quality of staff in adult learning and their competences in promoting career management skills (CMS) in addition to professional competencies. At a UK policy level, there has been a lack of investment in driving forward joint professional training for careers practitioners and allied workers in the community and other workplace settings. Likewise, ICT developments linked to Welfare Reform, improved labour market information (LMI), job application processes and vacancy handling remain somewhat distant from National Careers Services (ESRC, 2013)⁴². The findings also indicate strongly the need for careers services to operate alongside Job Centres, Recruitment Agencies, Private Careers Coaching Services and careers services within Further and Higher Education, emphasising the need for visibility and accessibility.

2.8 The matrix Standard is a quality framework for the effective delivery of information, advice and/or guidance on learning and work, designed to promote continuous improvement amongst individuals and organisations⁴³. Organisations are assessed every three years by externally appointed assessors and are required to seek continuous improvements in the way they deliver their service. The matrix Standard was launched in February 2002 and revised in 2005. In 2011, a restructured and revised version was trialled with organisations accredited or likely to seek accreditation against the Standard, and was confirmed as being more robust but achievable. The organisations valued: the alignment with business processes; the increased focus on outcomes; the links between organisational aims and objectives and service outcomes; the focus on staff development; and the use of targeted evaluation to support continuous improvement. The matrix Standard has been adopted by a range of organisations across the UK and in Europe where around 1,800 organisations are currently accredited under the Standard. It is the intellectual property of the Secretary of State for Business, Innovation and Skills (BIS) and is Crown Copyright.

2.9 The growing trend towards customised 'flexicurity'⁴⁴ regimes across Europe, where a trade-off between flexibility for employers, and security for employees has

³⁹ Social Research and Demonstration Corporation (2011) *Web-based Career Planning Tools Can Help Graduates to Achieve a Better Match Between their Skills and Employment*. SRDC. Available from: www.srdc.org/uploads/careermotion_final_report_en.pdf

⁴⁰ Mann, A. (2012) *It's who you meet: why employer contacts at school make a difference to the employment prospects of young adults*. London: Education and Employers Taskforce and UKCES (2013) *Nothing in Common* joint report. London: UKCES and the Education and Employers Taskforce.

⁴¹ http://ec.europa.eu/education/adult/agenda_en.htm

⁴² http://www2.warwick.ac.uk/fac/soc/ier/research/semcomprfs/esrc_policy_briefing_final_101212.pdf

⁴³ <http://matrixstandard.com/>

⁴⁴ Sultana, R. G (2011) *Flexicurity: Implications for Lifelong Career Guidance – Concept Note* commissioned by the European Lifelong Policy Network (ELGPN)

become a significant preoccupation of governments in driving forward economic, social and cultural well-being, adds a further layer of complexity. At present, many of those in work are under-employed - doing part-time instead of full-time jobs, best described as 'precarious work' - or accepting employment below the level for which they are qualified (Purcell et al, 2012: 174)⁴⁵. Not having a job at all is, of course, the ultimate form of 'work precarity', as it has become known (Eurobarometer, 2002: 62)⁴⁶. Clearly, new strategies are needed to ensure a growing number of individuals, particularly those in low paid work, do not find themselves marginalised and are able to advance their careers.

2.10 Active Labour Market (ALM) policies are an increasingly major priority for governments internationally and across Europe, with a range of new measures which seek to act on both supply and demand in the labour market (Clarke, 2004)⁴⁷. In the context of tackling unemployment, supporting businesses and developing careers, the four main themes in ALM policies are highlighted by Hooley et al, (2012)⁴⁸ are: *incentive reinforcement; employment assistance; occupation and human capital* for which career guidance is increasingly viewed as an important component. Close working links between the Public Employment Service (PES and National Careers Service practitioners are critical factors in seamless provision for unemployed adults.

2.11 In England, the National Careers Service has embedded practices in a national website and telephone services, as well as local presence in a wide range of community-based organisations ranging from libraries, jobcentres, mosques, supermarkets and many other community and voluntary sector organisations. The NCS in London delivers from over 300 regular locations and 300 ad hoc locations⁴⁹ to meet local community needs. Research findings on the recent expansion of co-location arrangements in Jobcentres and Further Education Colleges indicate good progress is being made, though data transfer arrangements remain a challenge.

2.12 A few recent examples of employer-led initiatives in London include:

- Bringing together of SMEs and freelancers in the Creative and Digital Media sector to improve supply chains.
- Creation of a Hospitality Guild and the extension of the National Skills Academy for Hospitality to cover Passenger Transport, Travel and Tourism.
- Employers in the Sports and Active Leisure sectors' Group Training Association (GTA)⁵⁰ supporting community clubs started through a partnership with the London Boroughs.

<http://www.hzz.hr/docslike/Flexicurity%20-%20Implications%20for%20Lifelong%20Career%20Guidance%20by%20prof.%20Sultana.pdf>

⁴⁵ Purcell, K., Elias, P., Atfield, G., Behle, H., Ellison, R., Luchinskaya, D., Snape, J., Conaghan, L., and Tzanakou, C. (2012) *Futuretrack Stage 4: transitions into employment, further study and other outcomes*. Coventry: Warwick Institute for Employment Research and the Higher Education Careers Service Unit, Manchester, November 2012.

⁴⁶ Eurobarometer (2002) *Social Precarity and Social Integration*, Brussels European Commission Directorate-General Employment Eurobarometer 56.1

⁴⁷ Clarke, J. (2004) *Changing Welfare Changing States: new directions in social policy*, London: Sage Publications Ltd. pp. 147 - 159

⁴⁸ <http://www.ukces.org.uk/assets/ukces/docs/publications/tackling-unemployment-supporting%20business-and-developing-careers.pdf>

⁴⁹ National Careers Service information provided by Head of NCS and Prospects, London: 120313 <http://www.prospects.co.uk/AboutUs/tabid/56/Default.aspx>

⁵⁰ The key aim of GTA is to open up opportunities for Apprenticeships to excluded groups and under-represented populations, supporting SMEs to take on adults (and young people) from these communities.

- Apprenticeships in Car Body and Collision Repair targeting disadvantaged and under-represented groups (including over 50s) with additional support across London.
- Gas and Waste Management sector piloting placement opportunities in London (UKCES, 2013)⁵¹.

2.13 It is too early to assess the extent to which these type of initiatives link to and from a National Careers Service, Jobcentre Plus and wider careers support market, particularly in terms of supporting the target groups identified by the Economy Committee. The voice of the user of adult guidance services should feature prominently, as currently being addressed by the Nordic countries⁵². Key elements include: for example, quality assurance mechanisms with an emphasis on user involvement; capacity building or training of both professionals and users; a consultative user forum; and the enhancement of vocational learning outcomes is recommended, such as career decision making competencies, job readiness, and job search skills.

⁵¹ UKCES Growth & Innovation Fund and Employer Ownership Round 1 Bids in London – March 2013.

⁵² http://www.nordvux.net/download/6821/voice_of_users.pdf

3.0 Targeting specific groups

3.1 There are various research studies which highlight key factors that impact upon the six groupings identified as key areas of interest by the Economy Committee. Firstly, a synthesis of research findings on **people returning to work after absence (including maternity leave)** broadly indicate women predominate in this group of returners, because they are more likely than men to take time out of the labour market for caring responsibilities. However, the EHRC (2008/9) reported changing attitudes amongst the men surveyed with 47% sharing childcare duties equally, and 55% willing to accept the primary care role if their partner earns more. Women are particularly vulnerable to the gender pay gap. According to the Fawcett Society⁵³, the pay gap (14.9 per cent across the country) is particularly high in London, at almost 23 per cent, with a 55 per cent gap in the financial services.⁵⁴

3.1.1 The circumstances of individuals and groups can differ considerably when it comes to returning to work after absence. Findings from the Recruitment and Employers Confederation Flexible Work Commission Report (REC, 2011)⁵⁵ highlight increased demand both from employers and employees in direct employment, as well as from individuals looking for *flexible options* outside of a standard contract of employment. Part-time work is on the rise, as is freelancing and temporary agency work. A CBI (2011)⁵⁶ survey found flexible working is now a standard feature of the modern UK workplace: nearly all employers (96%) offer at least one form of flexible working and nearly three quarters (70%) offer three or more.

3.1.2 Incentives through taxation, opportunities to change careers, being personally challenged and valued, are all factors impacting on personal decisions about returning to, staying on and/or leaving work. The Women's Business Council⁵⁷ reports to the Cabinet Office in June 2013 on careers guidance policy issues to facilitate greater participation of women in the workforce. The Council highlights the need to fully utilise the skills and qualifications of women who are currently out of work, and suggests this could deliver economic benefits of £15 to £21 billion per year. And if women set up businesses at the same rate as men, there would be an extra 150,000 start-ups in the UK each year⁵⁸.

3.1.3 In Australia, an *'In Experience+ and Career Advice for Parents'* programme⁵⁹ is one of the first of its kind providing professional career advice and a resumé appraisal service to Australians aged 45 years and over. The work is carried out mainly, though not exclusively, through a national telephone helpline. The programme has recently been extended to include parents seeking advice and assistance because of government changes to their parenting payments. All career practitioners in this programme meet professional standards for Australian career development practitioners. The challenge is to market these services more widely while managing the resources to meet demand.

⁵³ <http://www.fawcettsociety.org.uk/>

⁵⁴ <http://www.standard.co.uk/lifestyle/london-life/calling-all-london-women-from-now-until-the-end-of-the-year-you-are-going-to-be-working-for-free-8297263.html>

⁵⁵ <https://www.rec.uk.com/uploads/documents/rec-flexible-work-commission-report.pdf>

⁵⁶ http://www.cbi.org.uk/media/955608/2011.06-navigating_choppy_waters_-_employment_trends_survey.pdf

⁵⁷ <https://www.gov.uk/government/policy-advisory-groups/womens-business-council>

⁵⁸ Women's Business Council (2013) *Maximising women's contribution to economic growth*. London: Home Office, p.1.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/70245/evidence1.pdf

⁵⁹ <http://deewr.gov.au/experience>

3.1.4 In Belfast, a high level Strategic Steering Group has been set up to oversee and guide the implementation of the key areas of the strategy that takes account of the objectives of a number of cross-departmental strategies including, the Anti-Poverty Strategy, Children and Young People's Strategy, Innovation and Creativity Strategy, Partners for Change, and the Welfare Reform Agenda with a priority focus on the needs of *young people and adults* vulnerable to social exclusion. Linked to this, there is strong Ministerial interest in improving the usage and quality of labour market intelligence and information.

3.1.5 In British Columbia, the Targeted Initiative for Older Workers (TIOW)⁶⁰ provides employment assistance services and employability improvement activities, such as skills upgrading and work experience, to assist unemployed workers aged 55 to 64 with their return to work. TIOW is a federal-provincial/territorial cost-shared initiative that works with local service sector employers to facilitate productive matches with participants who have newly developed skills, thus addressing a local skills shortage and regional labour market need. A minimum of 80% of participants complete the programme and have a 'Return to Work' action plan with individual and unique goals to integrate into employment within 30 days of completion on the programme. Between 10 and 12 participants start each 10-week programme. The curriculum consists of employability and employment assistance activities. The model of delivery includes: an individual in-depth assessment conducted with each interested participant to determine the individual's re-employment needs. The assessment is based on the client's commitment to and need for:

- immediate reintegration into the workforce;
- improving employability skills; and
- learning with others in a similar age group.

3.1.6 In the UK, two employer-led initiatives were identified that specifically target women returners, companies Towry Law and Ernst & Young are working with 'CAPABILITYJANE'⁶¹. The extent to which these organisations work with the National Careers Service, in particular low skill adults, is unclear and requires more in-depth investigation.

3.2 Secondly, research findings on **mid-career changers** broadly indicate changing expectations of how long people will work and the challenges of an ageing workforce. In such circumstances, there could be significant cost-benefit advantages in offering mid-career workers career guidance that could extend the length of their careers. For example, learning through more challenging tasks following a job change is a most popular way for low skilled workers to upgrade their skills (Brown et al., 2010⁶²). Those who do not engage in substantive up-skilling or re-skilling, through either formal learning or learning in work, run the risk of being 'locked into' a particular way of working and are more vulnerable in the labour market if there is a significant change in their job or their circumstances. That is, career adaptability can either stall in its development or decay.

3.2.1 One opportunity for moving jobs or re-skilling could be apprenticeships. In recent years, *apprenticeships have extended to those in older age groups* – before

⁶⁰ http://www.hrsdc.gc.ca/eng/employment/employment_measures/older_workers/index.shtml and <http://www.encorebc.com/>

⁶¹ <http://www.capabilityjane.com/>

⁶² Brown, A., Bimrose, J., Barnes, S. -A., Kirpal, S., Grønning, T. and Dæhlen, M. (2010) 'Changing patterns of working, learning and career development across Europe: final report (EACEA/2007/07)', 1 - 82, Brussels: Education, Audiovisual & Culture Executive Agency. Available from: <http://www2.warwick.ac.uk/fac/soc/ier/people/furtherpubs/?ssn=sbAsS29EMEO=&inst=WARWICK>

2007 barely any older people started apprenticeships, but in 2011/12 over 45,000 people aged 45 or over started an apprenticeship. Women aged over 25 are more likely than men to start an apprenticeship: 115,000 women over 25 started an apprenticeship in 2011/12, compared to 67,000 men⁶³. The TUC currently has funding for an apprenticeship project for young people and adults. The main focus of the project is developing the TUC's existing policy on apprenticeships and supporting affiliate unions' work on apprenticeships across the country. The OECD notes the growth of trade-union activity in this area, particularly in the UK through 'learning representatives'⁶⁴. The Trade Union Congress⁶⁵ in London performs an active role in this regard.

3.2.2 In British Columbia (BC, the western province of Canada with a population for about 4.5 million) the private sector has led on the development of virtual careers services for adult client groups, across a geographically spread population. Contracts are tendered by the government that focus on particular populations, for different purposes. The recent tendering process recently completed in British Columbia (for the new Employment Program of BC) now required the setting up of one-stop centres based on geographically defined catchment areas. The Contractors of these centres must blend in other Service Providers (minimum of 25% of revenue must flow through to other agencies) into service delivery to ensure that Clients with unique needs are accommodated. It is also the Contractor's responsibilities to design a service model to ensure that timely services are available to reach all Citizens. Information is available about this change from the British Columbia website⁶⁶. An interesting example of practice is one private company that provides online spaces representing a new context for hosting a career intervention to assist clients to develop their careers. These individual 'career learning' interventions use an integrated blend of different forms of virtual services (e.g. email, web chat, SMS, telephone, etc.) together with the social medium of online spaces. Users of these services have independent online access with career practitioners, at a time of their choosing. In this case, the company (comprising three centres, together with 10 other organisations that have licensed their services) are offering services via a range of methods (individual & group learning both face to face and online). Goddard (2009)⁶⁷ highlights four key features and evaluation of these relatively new services seem extremely positive.

3.2.3 In Liverpool City Region⁶⁸, the process of researching and producing detailed *Skills for Growth Agreements* for key sectors – Low Carbon, SuperPort, Visitor Economy, and Knowledge Economy driven by a confident and strong partnership between the public and private sector. The City has developed its own LMI strategy and team. These have been directed by local business leaders with the support of colleges, training providers, the National Careers Service, National Apprenticeship Service and Job Centre Plus. Focused specifically on the key issues of demand and

⁶³ National Apprenticeship Service

⁶⁴ OECD (2007). *Op. cit.*, pp.66-68. The Leitch Report indicated that there were over 15,000 learning representatives across the UK. Leitch Review of Skills (2006). *Op. cit.*, p.108.

⁶⁵ Trades Union Congress (2003). *The ABC of IAG: How to Deliver Top-Quality IAG to Learners at Work*. London: Trades Union Congress. <http://www.equalworks.co.uk/resources/contentfiles/163.pdf>

⁶⁶ http://www.labourmarketservices.gov.bc.ca/community_organizations/service_providers_business_transformation.html. The link to the new programming website can also be found at: <http://www.workbc.ca/workbccentres/welcome.htm>

⁶⁷ Goddard, T. (2009) *Considering Online Career Interventions*. Training Innovations Inc. Training Innovations, Inc (Tii) is operator of eVolve Learning Technologies. Tii has 18 years of experience designing and delivering employment services on behalf of government, not-for-profit and business organizations in BC. Tii has developed and operates eVolve, a web-based learning platform, specifically designed for career and human development learning.

⁶⁸ <http://www.liverpoollep.org/pdf/LEPBOARDAUGUSTWEBDOCFINAL.pdf>

supply of sector skills these agreements provide a framework for the development and alignment of training provision with employer and individuals' needs. Greater Merseyside Partnership have also added a new dimension to their work on '*social impact bond*' (SIB) experience. This was born out of the large scale cuts in LA funding and focuses on the 14-18 age group in line with DWP Innovation Fund boundaries. However, there is growing interest within Liverpool to test out the feasibility of this approach in an adult guidance context. The key to this is the investor pool and the ultimate sponsor; i.e. who will pay the investor for outcomes and be prepared to do so at a cost plus premium through which investors get a return on their capital? There are a number of SIB applications being considered bearing in mind the NCS is a limited entitlement (maximum of 3 face to face sessions) and Unit costs are restrictive to address some of the more fundamental or intractable issues adults deal with in finding employment or moving through employment.

3.2.4 In seven regions of British Columbia, the ASPECT Targeted Skills Shortage Program (TSSP)⁶⁹ is focused on helping businesses and non-profit organizations grow the potential of their low skilled employees by providing access to funded training to eligible staff. This program has space available for up to 1,200 eligible employees and is available in every region of British Columbia. Each eligible employee can be provided with up to a maximum of \$1500 (\$7500 per employer) to be used towards training courses that are specific to the employees' workplace need. The employer and the employee(s) meet with a Training Coordinator to determine what type of courses are required to help your employee grow within your organization. The Training Coordinator will then fit needs to the appropriate courses. A similar approach was previously adopted in North Derbyshire, England⁷⁰, but ceased due to funding constraints. The findings from the programme suggest that with precise targeting, the use of guidance to support small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) is more cost effective than simple delivery of information and advice.

3.2.5 In 22 US States, the *Breaking Through initiative*⁷¹ promotes and strengthens the efforts of 41 community colleges to help low-skilled adults prepare for and succeed in occupational and technical degree programs. Breaking Through helps low-skilled adults' acquire skills necessary to succeed in post-secondary education and attain credentials. It rests on four high-leverage strategies to develop career and college pathways for students to advance their studies or enter family-supporting careers.

3.2.6 In the city of Hämeenlinna, Finland, the Public Employment Service arranges a weekly complementary open session in co-operation with education providers, third sector organisations and human resources development (HRD) staff from local companies. These sessions provide an opportunity for the service providers for networking and mutual learning, but also provide information to adults who are considering career change. Companies also provide information about available job vacancies.

3.2.7 In the city of Tampere, Finland, the local adult education institutions (in co-operation with the Public Employment Service) have piloted a mobile service for local companies. A mobile home vehicle has been converted to a small career centre with internet connections. This visits local employers and community centres with a strong emphasis on customer-focused approaches. The following activities are undertaken:

⁶⁹ <http://www.aspect.bc.ca/tssp/#cari>

⁷⁰ http://www.derby.ac.uk/files/iceqs_adapt_and_prosper2000.pdf

⁷¹ <http://www.jff.org/projects/current/workforce/breaking-through/20>

small group meetings for job searching; personal face-to-face guidance for individuals immediately after group sessions or with scheduled appointments; participation in local fairs, work in libraries, shopping malls, and commercial fairs; participation in meetings organised by voluntary sector organisations, information on entrepreneurship; visits into companies; evaluation of staff professional competencies; and identification of staff training needs.

3.2.8 In Iceland, the main goal of the project 'Guidance and Counselling in the Workplace'⁷² is to bring information and counselling about skills development to people in their workplaces. The objective is to reach out to the target group to deliver information and guidance, as well as to analyse the need for education in order to develop suitable courses. The target group is mainly people with little formal education who are around one third of the Icelandic labour market. Bringing information and guidance to this group is anticipated to have an impact on participation in lifelong learning and so to raise the educational level of the nation. The project is financed by the Ministry of Education, Science and Culture, co-ordinated by the Education and Training Service Centre (ETSC) and works in co-operation with stakeholders (unions, educational funds and educational providers). The career counsellors establish collaboration with companies, offer presentations and provide individual interviews in the workplace or at their centre. The approach is person-centred, with individuals being assisted to find suitable learning pathways. Personal follow-up is also provided. Since 2006, the project has provided about 20,000 interviews nationwide. More people from the target group are now coming to lifelong learning centres for guidance on their own initiative.

3.3 Thirdly, research findings on those **people aged 50+** are well documented at a national, EU and international level (Cappellari et al., 2005⁷³; Bimrose & Brown, 2010⁷⁴; Brown and Bimrose, 2011⁷⁵). The main reasons for lower participation of older workers in the workforce is due mainly to:

- a lack of incentives for employers to hire them and disincentives for older workers to remain at work;
- a gender aspect in relation to older workers, with women having a lower participation rate and a more discontinuous working career than men; and
- physical health, disability, job quality, working times can be negative (p. 25).

3.3.1 Ford (2005)⁷⁶ outlines the economic, social and individual dimension of third-age under-employment and sets out strategies, including international perspectives, on career guidance provision in a wide range of settings (pp. 34-60).

3.3.2 McNair (2011)⁷⁷ argues that careers guidance services could help:

⁷² http://www.programkontoret.se/Global/Engelsk%20webbplats/Grundtvig%20Conference/Sigridur_Disa_Gunnarsdottir.pdf

⁷³ Cappellari, L., Dorsett, R. & Haile, G. (2005). *Labour Market Transitions among the Over-50s*. Leeds: Department for Work and Pensions. <http://www.psi.org.uk/pdf/LabMarketTransitions.pdf>

⁷⁴ Bimrose, J. and Brown, A. (2010) *Older workers' transitions in work-related learning, careers and identities*, in *Transitions and learning through the lifecourse*, Editors: Ecclestone, K., Biesta, G. and Hughes, M. (9780415481731) New York: Routledge

⁷⁵ Brown, A. and Bimrose, J. (2011) 'Changing patterns of guidance, learning and careers of older workers in Europe', in *Working and ageing: Guidance and counselling for mature learners*, 166- 187, Editors: CEDEFOP (978-92-896-0851-0) Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union

⁷⁶ Ford, G. (2005) *Am I Still Needed? Guidance and Learning for Older Adults*. Derby: Centre for Guidance Studies, University of Derby.

⁷⁷ Mc Nair, S. (2011) *Learning, work and later life in the UK: guidance needs of an ageing workforce in Working and Ageing*. Guidance and Counselling for Mature Learners. Thessaloniki: CEDEFOP p.139. http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/EN/Files/3062_en.pdf

- people in the third age (broadly from 50 to 75+) who wish to continue to contribute to society through paid or unpaid work;
- employers, who will increasingly need to retain older workers, in face of labour shortages;
- those experiencing age discrimination, which remains a powerful force excluding people from paid work, especially in recruitment;
- people whose talents and changing aspirations are not being recognised by their employers.

3.3.3 Flexibility of options and knowledge of career pathways are important for older workers. Workers require financial incentives, work to be attractive, and positive attitudes from employers (Simonazzi, 2009, p. 24)⁷⁸. It is argued that employers should design job roles to suit the skills and experiences of older workers, and with consideration of lifestyle needs, cultural background and recognition of career change possibilities (Bimrose & McNair, 2011)⁷⁹.

3.3.4 The Independent Inquiry into the Future for Lifelong Learning (IFLL, 2009)⁸⁰ found evidence that 'forced early retirement' is linked to poor health for the rest of life. The EHRC policy briefing 'Working Better - The over 50s, the new work generation'⁸¹, includes findings of a survey on the work aspirations of the over 50s, and the barriers they face. It reveals that many assumptions made about this age group are wrong: that the majority of workers over 50 want to continue working beyond state pension age with the option of flexible working, and that a significant proportion of them want promotion and/or continue to have a passion for learning.

3.3.5 Some examples of initiatives aimed at the 50+ group have already been outlined above. McNair (op.cit) argues the challenge is to make sure that older workers and their employers are aware of barriers and opportunities, and prepare for them. He suggests that more attention should be given to career review, and guidance more generally after the mid-40s, before the effect of age discrimination becomes severe, regularly reviewing how to develop transferable, and demonstrable, skills which will increase security, with the current firm, with another firm or in an extended retirement. An in-depth literature review (Bimrose et al.2007)⁸², examining skills appraisals to help identify and measure individual skills levels (*including those skills needed by employers*); and screening methodologies that help recognise influences on employability (*including individual lack of skills*) undertaken on behalf of the Department for Work and Pensions, revealed a proliferation of skills health checks and appraisal instruments. Yet there has been limited practice in the assessment of adult skills for employability, with no one suitable 'off-the-shelf' tool that can be identified. The National Institute for Adult Continuing Education (NIACE) pilot 'a mid-life career review'⁸³ aims 'to encourage and support people to review the learning and skills they need to successfully manage the second half of their lives. With more and more people remaining in paid work beyond state pension age (currently over 50,000), there is a need for adults to review their career aspirations,

⁷⁸ Op.cit.

⁷⁹ Bimrose, J. and McNair, S. (2011) 'Career support for migrants: Transformation or Adaptation?', *Journal Of Vocational Behavior*, 78 (3), 321 - 392 (0001-8791)

⁸⁰ IFLL website. Accessed 04.04.10: www.lifelonglearninginquiry.org.uk.

⁸¹ Maitland, A. (2010). *Working Better: The over 50s, the new work generation*. EHRC.

http://www.equalityhumanrights.com/uploaded_files/publications/workingbetter_over_50s.pdf

⁸² Bimrose, J., Barnes, S.-A , Brown, A., Hasluck, C. & Behle, H. (2007). *Skills Diagnostics and Screening Tools: A Literature Review*. London: Department for Work and Pensions.

<http://research.dwp.gov.uk/asd/asd5/rports2007-2008/rrep459.pdf>

⁸³ <http://www.niace.org.uk/news/mid-life-career-review-niace-proposals-endorsed>

training, health, finances and retirement plans before age-discrimination and ill health begin to limit choices.

3.3.6 In Victoria, Australia, the 'Experience+ Corporate Champion programme'⁸⁴ led by the Australian Government, supports employers⁸⁵ who commit to moving towards best practice in the recruitment and retention of staff over 45 years. This has been successfully piloted in Victoria and other major cities throughout Australia. Employers participating in the program can receive the following support: a professional assessment of their workforce strategies; recruitment and retention practices; practical help developing an Action Plan using an 'Investing in Experience Toolkit' which includes: updating recruitment processes, rolling out new flexible working arrangements and putting into practice retention and mentoring programs for mature-age workers. Support is also available in accessing Australian Government financial assistance including 'Experience and Job Bonus', wage subsidies and training support. Advice is readily available on positive age management, superannuation, occupational health and safety, career planning, training and age discrimination.. The level of help available will vary depending on the size and needs of the employer. Small, medium and large employers may be eligible to receive support through the Corporate Champions program.

3.3.7 In Northern Ireland, the Step Ahead 50+ initiative⁸⁶, funded by the Northern Ireland Executive (DEL), as part of its 'Jobs and Economy Initiative' is a strand of the Department's main adult return to work programme 'Steps To Work' aimed at people aged 50 and over. A total of 300 fixed-term employment opportunities are currently allocated which last up to 26 weeks in the voluntary/community sector to give individuals work experience and a recent employment history which will enable them to compete more effectively for jobs. To be eligible participants must be 50 years old or older, and out of work, in receipt of Jobseeker's Allowance, Income Support, Incapacity Benefit or Employment and Support Allowance for 12 months or more.

3.3.8 In Glasgow, the City Council hosted a Commonwealth Employment Initiatives⁸⁷ event at which over 400 businesses were invited to attend. The approach adopted is to set out the four potential groups of individuals to recruit, including unemployed people over 50. Also, the City Council has launched the Glasgow Veterans Employment Programme⁸⁸, under which the council will pay a wage subsidy to city employers taking on unemployed forces personnel, as part of a comprehensive package of support.

3.3.9 In London, the Prince's Initiative for Mature Enterprise (PRIME)⁸⁹ aims to enable the creation of 1,000 new businesses per annum. It raises awareness of issues facing the over 50s and the profile of PRIME, by focusing on business survival rates to ensure these exceed the national average.

3.3.10 In Malta, employers are encouraged to appreciate the benefits of recruiting over 50s to fill their job vacancies. To help employers to do so, various schemes were created, including the Employment Training Placement Scheme (ETPS)⁹⁰

⁸⁴ <http://deewr.gov.au/experience-corporate-champions>

⁸⁵ Eligible Employers receive tailored support and assistance valued up to \$10,000 provided by an industry expert through the Experience+ Corporate Champions programme.

⁸⁶ <http://www.delni.gov.uk/stw-operational-guidelines-memo-21-12.pdf>

⁸⁷ <http://www.glasgow.gov.uk/index.aspx?articleid=9682>

⁸⁸ <http://www.glasgow.gov.uk/index.aspx?articleid=9515>

⁸⁹ <https://secure.thebiggive.org.uk/charity/view/7855>

⁹⁰ <http://www.eurofound.europa.eu/publications/htmlfiles/ef070527.htm>

where employers recruiting unemployed workers receive a subsidy of half the value of the national minimum wage for a period of 26 weeks.

3.4 Fourthly, for **unemployed adults**, research specifically from within the careers sector is largely under-developed, partly due to constant shifts in policy focus. More generally, studies in this area find that career guidance can have a positive impact on unemployed people's life satisfaction and life chances. Studies by MORI (1996; 2001)⁹¹ found that the majority of unemployed users of career guidance reported positive outcomes and successful transitions to learning and work.

3.4.1 Bysshe (1998)⁹² in a study of guidance services (for long-term unemployed people in five member states of the European Union (Germany, Greece, Netherlands, Sweden, UK)), concluded that effective guidance services can enable long-term unemployed people to make more effective transitions. In Australia, Patton & Donohue (1998)⁹³ found that the overwhelming majority of participants in a *career guidance programme for unemployed people* believed that career guidance was effective: it had supported them to develop more realistic aspirations and had expanded their work opportunities.

3.4.2 In Gateshead, a large-scale regeneration is happening which is due to continue until 2014/15. This has created a large number of job vacancies with well known businesses for example, Tesco, Morrisons, Asda, Greggs and Costa Coffee. Recruitment events have taken place, planned and supported by local partners, namely the National Career Service, Gateshead College and Gateshead Council, in order to fill positions for Tesco. The other employers have yet to announce their vacancies. There were in the region of 2,500 applications for these posts and of those applicants, 500 were successful and have begun pre-employment training. A focus group has now been established with representation from Gateshead College, Gateshead Council, training providers, the National Careers Service, National Apprenticeship Service and Jobcentre Plus so that together we could devise a programme of support for the 2000 + unsuccessful applicants. In addition, a programme has been put together by the training providers that will concentrate on developing specific skills, such as Customer Service, IT, and general employability skills. The National Careers Service (along with the Council) have a plan in place to engage with the 2000+ customers in order to support them in their Career Choice and to identify their skills gaps. The customers will then be signposted to the most appropriate provision for their training needs. The support programme will help customers make realistic job applications based on real and current local Labour Market Information, supplied by both employer partners and the National Careers Service Labour Market Information Officer. This will be an ongoing process with partners looking collectively at employers' needs and then adapting the approach accordingly.

3.4.3 In major cities in Sweden⁹⁴, the government supports adult education (AE) providers in organising guidance courses to facilitate the Accreditation of Prior Learning (APL). A course equivalent to 10 weeks' full-time study can be supported by

⁹¹ MORI (1996). *Evaluation of ESF Vocational Guidance and Counselling Schemes*. London: Department for Education and Employment. See also, MORI (2001). *Demand for Information, Advice and Guidance*. Winchester: The Guidance Council.

⁹² Bysshe, S. (1998). The role of guidance in tackling long-term unemployment: lessons from the European Union-funded GALTUN Action Research Programme. *Newscheck*, 9(2): 17-18.

⁹³ Donohue, R. & Patton, W. (1998). The effectiveness of a career guidance program with long-term unemployed individuals. *Journal of Employment Counseling*, 35(4): 179-194.

⁹⁴ ELGPN (2012) Case Study 4.9 p. 31

http://ktl.jyu.fi/img/portal/23229/ELGPN_resource_kit_2011-12_web.pdf?cs=1350649791

government grants. The course can take different formats: it can be organised for an individual or for a group, and can be full-time or part-time. The Education Act stipulates that before starting an AE course, every applicant must be offered career guidance in designing an individual study plan. If career counsellors identify the possibility of APL, they can encourage the applicant to apply for a bespoke guidance course. It is common for such courses to start with a general mapping of competences, followed by a more detailed mapping, often in co-operation with skilled craftsmen. The student participates in the process, and a workplace tutor and a vocational education and training tutor follow up the results, with the career counsellor acting as a co-ordinator. The results of the APL can be used to shorten the time needed to reach diploma level. The results also help the participants to enhance their career management skills: knowledge about the value of their existing competences and how to further develop them.

3.4.5 In Manchester, 'The New Economy'⁹⁵ is the co-ordinating body for the Greater Manchester City Strategy. They have successfully built a new partnership between the ten local authority areas and other key stakeholders, including Jobcentre Plus, to design and deliver services to enable more people to move off benefits and into work. The New Economy's Board has also been designated as the statutory Employment and Skills Board (ESB) to lead on the production of an Employment and Skills Strategy for Greater Manchester. Manchester Solutions works very closely with the New Economy which provides them with 'hard LMI', including a range of local LMI and economic intelligence. A single 'Greater Manchester Forecasting Model' delivered by Oxford Economics is utilised to ensure a consistent approach is adopted across the region. A 'Work Matters' website⁹⁶ developed by staff from the Connexions services operating in each of the ten boroughs of Greater Manchester collaborated on the re-development which was led by Careers Solutions and informed by information provided by the New Economy. In preparation for the launch of the new National Careers Service, the Careers Solutions Development Team also worked with the Next Step Greater Manchester Prime Contractor to ensure the resource was suitable for use with adults as well as young people. Work Matters includes data and resources related to the labour market in Greater Manchester and beyond. An interesting feature on the site is that data has been analysed to show how many people travel from one part of Greater Manchester (and the surrounding areas) to another for work. This helps to illustrate that an increasing number of people need to travel across the sub-region to find suitable employment. A guiding principle within the organisation is that advisers should develop their capacity and capability to undertake LM-related research and analysis for themselves supported by systems and processes such as the SharePoint staff intranet, Work Matters and bi-monthly network days that frequently cover LMI topics⁹⁷.

3.4.6 In Leeds, the Leeds City Region Partnership⁹⁸ brings together the eleven local authorities to ensure the city region economy continues to grow. In order to achieve this goal and address the city region's economic challenges, the Leeds City Region has established a Local Enterprise Partnership (LEP). The LEP's plans are set out within its recently published Partnership Plan. A key action point is to: 'promote better information about growth sectors for learners, employers, colleges, universities and training providers to make more informed decisions, working with the

⁹⁵ http://neweconomymanchester.com/stories/822-economic_intelligence

⁹⁶ <http://www.wmgm.co.uk/>

⁹⁷ UKCES (2012) Using and Sharing Career Related Labour Market Research Report, Wath-Upon-Deane, South Yorkshire: UKCES pp.46-47

<http://www.ukces.org.uk/assets/ukces/docs/publications/lmiresearchreport.pdf>

⁹⁸ This covers Barnsley, Bradford, Calderdale, Craven, Harrogate, Kirklees, Leeds, Selby, Wakefield and York and North Yorkshire County Council.

careers sector where appropriate'. The LEP has produced a series of career-related LMI materials on their priority sectors (including manufacturing and hospitality and tourism). The LEP has also undertaken 'Skills Priority Analysis' research which compares the learning and training provision available within the region with current and trend data on employment opportunities. The aim is to highlight actual as well as potential mismatches in skills supply and demand. An Information Services Team has secured a three-year contract to deliver an online careers information directory for young people in the London Borough of Islington. A key role for the Information Services Team is to identify and fill 'information gaps'. They have produced and maintained a searchable database of local provision at level 2 and below aimed at vulnerable adults (KirkleesCLiK)⁹⁹. It was agreed with key local partners that a useful addition would be to develop a list of all local providers of employment support services (e.g. work clubs).

3.5 Fifthly, research findings on **careers guidance services for disabled people** are generally minimalist. Disability Rights UK highlights these are people more likely to have no or few qualifications, face unemployment, to work part-time and be under-represented in senior positions than non-disabled people. They are likely to earn less than non-disabled people, and are three times more likely to exit from work (Rigg, 2005)¹⁰⁰. Findings from the National Guidance Research Forum (NGRF, 2012) indicate there are significant differences in the economic activity rates of disabled men and women. For those employed disabled people have lower average hourly earnings than the non-disabled and this pay gap is increasing¹⁰¹. Research has shown that there is too much emphasis on disabled people changing to accommodate employers rather than employers making reasonable adjustments for disabled people (op.cit).

3.5.1 In London, Disability Rights UK have produced a specialist handbook, namely, *'Doing Careers Differently'*¹⁰² which is an exemplar of good and interesting practice.

3.5.2 In Brisbane, Queensland, specialist disability career development practitioners are recruited by the council to support disabled workers¹⁰³. In addition, a study by Scales (2010)¹⁰⁴ found that employers, who provide career development opportunities have better employee engagement, are less likely to lose talent and are more productive than equivalent organisations that do not.

3.6 Sixthly, the picture for **black, Asian and ethnic minorities** shows Pakistani and Bangladeshi groups (particularly women) suffering the worst employment disadvantage (Dustmann et al., 2003)¹⁰⁵. Research findings highlight the position of women from ethnic minority groups in the labour market is markedly different and unequal to that of men. Pakistani and Bangladeshi women have a higher risk of being economically inactive and are the most disadvantaged. Some ethnic groups

⁹⁹ UKCES (2012) Using and Sharing Career Related Labour Market Research Report, Wath-Upn-Deane, South Yorkshire: UKCES pp. 22. Visit: <http://www.kirkleesclik.org.uk/>

¹⁰⁰ Rigg, J. (2005). *Labour Market Disadvantage among Disabled People: A Longitudinal Perspective*. London: Centre for Analysis of Social Exclusion, London School of Economics. <http://sticerd.lse.ac.uk/dps/case/cp/CASEpaper103.pdf>

¹⁰¹ <http://www2.warwick.ac.uk/fac/soc/ier/ngrf/>

¹⁰² <http://www.radar.org.uk/publications/doing-careers-differently/>

¹⁰³ Example of job description received from expert informant available upon request

¹⁰⁴ Scales, M.J. (2010). *Developing Talent: How Career Opportunities Drive Business Performance*. London: Right Management. <http://www.right.com/thought-leadership/e-newsletter/developing-talent-how-career-opportunities-drive-business-performance.pdf>

¹⁰⁵ Dustmann, C., Fabbri, F., Preston, I. & Wadsworth, J. (2003). *Labour Market Performance of Immigrants in the UK Labour Market*. London: Home Office.

display distinctive patterns of segregation by occupation and industry - for example, the concentration of Asian women in the distribution sector, some black women are strategically choosing careers such as nursing and social work that are considered to be gendered because these jobs offer a greater possibility of entry to courses, access to employment opportunities, qualification and promotion. Role models, coaches, mentors and/or careers guidance specialists in the workplace can help to support women overcoming barriers to progression and achievement.

3.6.1 Arulmani (2011)¹⁰⁶ refers to the need for '*a cultural preparedness*' to careers interventions taking into account different *cultural heritages*. Aston (2009)¹⁰⁷ explores the areas which career guidance seeks to influence, related to self-knowledge, self-concept, labour market knowledge and labour market competence. From this it is clear that enhanced attitudes and employability skills are not sufficient in and of themselves to guarantee employment and that economic and labour market conditions also impact on the relevance of employability skills. Bimrose (2006)¹⁰⁸ calls for models and methods in guidance and counselling that are relevant to cultural settings and circumstance. The Careers Service in New Zealand and Careers Wales provide some interesting careers policies and practices in this regard working with the *indigenous population* and *face-to-face and online careers service delivery* attuned to local needs.

3.6.2 In New Zealand, several cross-government initiatives are underway to not only improve but also enhance the labour participation of under-represented groups. For example, the New Zealand Settlement Strategy, led by the Department of Labour¹⁰⁹, aims to improve settlement outcomes, including labour market outcomes, for migrants and refugees. In some cases migrants and refugees have the skills needed by the labour market but lack localised knowledge which then acts as a barrier for the effective utilisation of their skills and expertise. In other cases, existing qualifications or expertise gained overseas may not be recognised by industry or professional registration bodies or are deemed to be not relevant to the New Zealand labour market. As part of this cross-government initiative, tailored career and labour market information and advice is offered by the New Zealand Careers Service to migrants and refugees. Improving the matching of migrants and refugees' skills and talents to the New Zealand labour market supports the strategy's goal that migrants, refugees and their families obtain employment appropriate to their skills and complements other aspects of the strategy. One of New Zealand's current approaches to the issue of labour supply is to identify groups within the population who are under-represented in the labour market and who might benefit from some intervention. For example, Maori and Pacific peoples are:

- significantly under-represented at degree and post-degree level in tertiary education;
- more likely to leave school with low or no qualifications; and
- have higher unemployment rates than the national average.

The provision of careers IAG is increasingly being seen as a useful intervention tool. Maori and Pacific peoples can often take a different approach to the acquisition of knowledge and skills than other New Zealanders. It is sometimes more appropriate,

¹⁰⁶ Arulmani, G. (2011) Striking the Right Note: the Cultural Preparedness Approach to Developing Resonant Career Guidance Programmes in *International Journal of Educational and Vocational Guidance*, 11, 1.

¹⁰⁷ Aston, J., Bellis, A., Munro, M., Pillai, R. & Willison, R. (2009). *Evaluation of Partners' Outreach for Ethnic Minorities (POEM): Final Report*. London: Department for Work and Pensions.

¹⁰⁸ Bimrose, J. (2006) *The Changing Context of Career Practice: Guidance, Counselling or Coaching?* Derby: Centre for Guidance Studies.

¹⁰⁹ <http://www.ssnz.govt.nz/publications/NZSettlementStrategy.pdf>

therefore, to offer career guidance for these groups in a different context and environment to that offered generally. The careers service offers a customised approach for Maori and Pacific peoples by delivering career guidance within a framework that acknowledges their cultural beliefs and values.

3.6.3 In Wales, Careers Wales provides a free (at point of delivery) bilingual, careers information, advice and guidance (IAG) service that aims to be both nationally coherent and locally responsive. Its Education Business Partnership (EBP) activities include: facilitating work experience placements for young people; mentoring programmes; teacher and lecturer placements; enterprise and business awareness events; and a range of tailored business support services. As such, Careers Wales is integrated into the delivery of a range of economic and social strategies¹¹⁰ in Wales¹¹⁰. The work of an All-Wales LMI group has enabled the production of new materials and resources (e.g. the Sector LMI)¹¹¹. In summer 2013, the First Deputy Minister will chair a Careers Strategic Forum to examine and strengthen careers policies across departments with the business, education and careers sector. Bi-lingual and online personalised services for adults are identified topics for continued development.

3.6.4 In Finland, a Ministerial budget of around £20m is allocated per annum in over 30 regional pilots which aim to support cross-sectoral guidance services. The national online services¹¹² are developed by the Ministries, with a telephone helpline offer and the next step is to make greater use of videoconferencing. Guidance services in adult education institutes vary. However, the legislation on adult education includes student entitlements for support in individual study plans and recognition of prior learning. The individualisation of the learning plan includes a customised guidance process. According to the Finnish integration law (1999, 2005) *immigrants have also the right to an integration plan*. This includes the definition of the individual needs and goals of the immigrant and the services that are needed to gain the goals.

3.6.6 Griffen and Miller (2007)¹¹³ highlight the relevance and applicability of an intervention is often poor when 'universal' principles are applied without considering the ways in which they need to be adapted to particular characteristics of a particular setting (There are strong arguments made for more *personalised services* and for incorporating *indigenous constructs and concepts* into adult guidance whereby interventions are more sustainable when they fit in with culturally endorsed images and beliefs about career development (Arulmani and Abdulla, 2007)¹¹⁴. Hambly (2011)¹¹⁵ highlights approaches used by careers practitioners linked to motivational interviewing (Miller and Rollnick, 1992) and Neuro-Linguistic Programming (Bandlet and Grinder, 1975a; 1975b).

3.6.7 In the Maldives, the Employment Skills Training Project of the Maldivian Ministry of Higher Education, Employment and Social Security (MHESS) JIVA

¹¹⁰ <http://www.careerswales.com/>

¹¹¹ UKCES (2012) UKCES (2012) Using and Sharing Career Related Labour Market Research Report, Wath-Upon-Deane, South Yorkshire: UKCES pp. 28.

¹¹² http://www.opinovi.fi/index.php?option=com_content&view=category&layout=blog&id=136&Itemid=384&lang=en

¹¹³ Griffen, J.P. and Miller, E. (2007) A research practitioners' perspective on culturally relevant prevention: Scientific and practical considerations for community-based programs, *The Counseling Psychologist*, 35 (6), pp. 850-859

¹¹⁴ Arulmani, G. And Abdulla, A. (2007) Capturing ripples: addressing the sustainability of the impact of social marketing, *Social Marketing Quarterly*, 13 (4) pp.84-107

¹¹⁵ Hambly, L. (2011) *Prayer, meditation and contemplation in career decision making*. Canterbury Christchurch Occasional Paper Series pp.33-39

initiative - '*Yes...because I can*'¹¹⁶, is an intervention programme devised by a consultant psychologist and social marketing specialist that targets young people's attitudes and mind sets toward work, employment and careers. The logo of the service is a finger print to reflect the uniqueness of individuals and their career paths. Lessons learned from this could potentially be considered in a London adult guidance context.

3.6.8 In Toronto, Canada, VS Toronto¹¹⁷ helps people succeed by providing employment, social, and educational services which meet the changing needs of diverse communities, building on our experience serving the Jewish community. This community-led organisation has launched innovative summer employment programs for individuals with disabilities, partnering in one instance with the Reena Foundation and the Geneva Centre for Autism.

3.6.9 In Cork, Ireland¹¹⁸, an adult careers network has recently formed to strengthen community services involving key agencies across the city that specialise in working with specific target groups.

3.6.10 In Germany, the Lernen-vor-Ort (Local Learning) programme¹¹⁹ of the Federal Government, run by the Federal Ministry of Education and Research, is the most comprehensive program which encourages and funds municipalities who establish regional or local educational networks, including all relevant actors and stakeholders to improve lifelong learning. The program involves private foundations which are invited to support the local activities with funding or other assistance. There are four action fields in the program¹²⁰: including educational monitoring and educational guidance. Among other activities they built up educational guidance services which are open to everybody with easy access and free of cost. A network of institutions who provide guidance services were involved (adult education, schools, chambers of commerce and craft, youth centres, job centres etc.). Each municipality designed their own services according to the needs and possibilities of the region. Some were quite creative in designing easy to access services. Some examples of cities who run extensive guidance programs include the city of Dresden for instance with a 'Guidance Bus' which offers services directly in the neighborhoods.

¹¹⁶ The original Indian understanding weaves life and work closely together. 'Jiva' means 'life' in almost all Indian languages. Individuals participating in the JIVA programme learn that progress may not always point in the 'forward direction'. In fact, it is suggested that healthy career development may require one to return to earlier learnings, let go of previous positions and start afresh.

http://www.skillsdevelopment.org/knowledge_portal/case_studies/yes_because_i_can.aspx

¹¹⁷ http://www.jvstoronto.org/uploads/File/pdf/Annual%20Report/JVS_Toronto_Annual_Report_2011-2012_Web_Version.pdf

¹¹⁸ Source: NGCE, Ireland – see Appendix 1

¹¹⁹ <http://www.lernen-vor-ort.info/>

¹²⁰ <http://www.bildung.koeln.de/qib;>

<http://www.bildung.dresden.de/de/bildungsberatung.php>; http://www.leipzig.de/de/buerger/bildung/lernen_vorort/17789.shtml; <http://www.leif-freiburg.de/>

4.0 Other selected examples of good and interesting careers policies and practices

4.1 The following additional examples have been included to further illustrate possible frameworks and approaches relevant to adult guidance developments in London. These include: approaches to branding, marketing and promotions; a pedagogical framework, underpinned by careers and work coaches; a high street resource centre model; and other forms of social partnerships, co-funded alliances and community adult education initiatives.

4.2 In the UK, the most extensive branding, marketing and promotions activity so far for career guidance services has been that provided by Learndirect. This included extensive advertising on prime-time television. Such advertising has been shown to produce impressively high levels of service recognition, and (by international standards) very high volumes of service take-up¹²¹. In 2006 Learndirect received nearly 900,000 calls and its website was used for over 9 million web sessions (these data include England, Wales and Northern Ireland, but exclude Scotland). These penetration levels are linked to high levels of brand recognition among the general public (over 80%), which in turn is linked to heavy investment in marketing (one-third of total turnover). The relationship can be demonstrated by the comparable figures for Career Services in New Zealand (an integrated multi-channel all-age service) where the marketing budget as a proportion of total turnover has been a little over one-fifth of the Learndirect level, the level of brand recognition has only been around 30% of the general public, and the level of usage of the helpline (the most readily comparable service) has been under a quarter of that for the Learndirect helpline.

4.3 In Scotland, the 'Curriculum Excellence Framework' (Scottish Government, 2008) is *the* main driving force underpinning new pedagogical approaches in primary and secondary education. Within this, a dominant theme for *learners of all-ages* is to build 'core competencies' and 'career management skills'.

- A Scottish Blueprint framework, based on the Canadian and Australian 'Blueprint for Life Design'¹²², offers learning for adults and young people through the curriculum, web-and telephony-based careers service, entitled '*My World of Work*'¹²³. This also encompasses a pioneering approach in the integration of theoretical and practice-based models of careers guidance and coaching.
- Some practitioners are employed as '*careers and work coaches*' delivering a facilitative and empowerment approach to support individuals' career management competencies. Whilst this already exists in career guidance, it manifests itself more overtly in the language of career coaching. Skills Development Scotland (SDS) and iCould represents a *partnership between the public sector and a not-for-profit charity*. This partnership has enabled Skills Development Scotland to provide access to YouTube style videos, developed by iCould, on the publicly funded website '*My World of Work*'.

4.4 In Northern Ireland, investment in high street resource centres located in Belfast and Londonderry, close proximity to major shopping precincts attract a wide

¹²¹ See Watts, A.G. (2007). *Career Services: a Review in an International Perspective*. Wellington, New Zealand: Career Services.

¹²² <http://blueprint.edu.au/TheToolkit/UsingtheBlueprintwithAdults.aspx>

¹²³ <http://www.myworldofwork.co.uk/>

range of adults seeking to return to learning and work. This is supplemented by adult community networks working closely with the careers service. Also, in Perth, Western Australia (WA), a state-government funded Career Centre combines a mixed model of shop-front service and online-services¹²⁴. WA is in a mining boom, so it should be expected that government resources will be directed toward labour for that industry.

4.5 In England, the Department for Business, Innovation and Skills (BIS) and Horseshmouth (a mentoring network)¹²⁵ provide access to a number of Enterprise and Business mentors through the Horseshmouth website, recognising that the technology used by Horseshmouth can widen access to the specialist and expert advice.

4.6 In Boston, USA *Accelerating Opportunity*¹²⁶ focuses on jobs, the economy, and improving opportunities for adults. This four-year initiative aims to drive economic recovery for individuals and communities by substantially increasing the number of adults who earn the credentials and skills they need to get and succeed in family-sustaining jobs. This initiative is fundamentally changing the way Adult Basic Education (ABE) is structured and delivered at state and institutional levels; and promotes state and institution policies to dramatically increase the number of individuals who complete credentials of value in the labour market. An unprecedented philanthropic investment in ABE, *Accelerating Opportunity* is funded by the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, The Joyce Foundation, the W.K. Kellogg Foundation, the Kresge Foundation, and the Open Society Foundations.

¹²⁴ <http://www.careercentre.dtwd.wa.gov.au/Pages/CareerCentre.aspx>.

¹²⁵ <http://www.horseshmouth.co.uk/>

¹²⁶ http://www.naleo.org/institutes/AC-ED_Orlando2012/12.%20Accelerating%20Opportunity

5.0 Conclusions

5.1 In summary, a 'one-size fits all approach' to adult guidance services is undesirable, ineffective and likely to be costly for individuals, employers and governments. The available research evidence highlights how adult guidance strategies in most major cities in the UK (and further afield) are often fragmented and diffuse. Allowing a diverse range of services to be provided throughout the lifespan within one organisational system framework is potentially: more cost-effective, avoids unnecessary duplication of resources and age-segmented services; and provides potential opportunities for inter-generational learning.

5.2 Shifts towards more localised provision such as Local Enterprise Partnerships (LEPs) highlight the necessity of both a National Careers Framework, supported by local partnership approaches to reduce confusion and duplication in training and resources, especially LMI and ICT developments, and to raise quality standards. A London-wide Careers Strategic Steering Group could assist the Greater London Assembly (GLA) and London Enterprise Panel (LEP) in their employer engagement and industrial strategy plans, similar to that adopted in Northern Ireland and forthcoming strategic arrangements in Wales.

5.3 Given the sheer size of London and its sub-regions a mixed model of high street shop-front services, online and outreach community-provision is highly relevant, combining best practice from Northern Ireland, Wales, Scotland, New Zealand and British Columbia. The latter offers an opportunity to further strengthen closer working links between Jobcentre Plus and the National Careers Service using new approaches to e-coaching and e-guidance.

5.4 The brand and visibility of adult guidance services (and young people's services) could be further enhanced through a targeted campaign using multi-media channels, similar to the earlier Learndirect approach. There is also scope to consider lessons learned from the Maldives regarding an innovative approach to careers services. In addition, all users need clarity on their entitlements – where they can get what, and from whom.

5.5 Other consistent findings highlight: firstly, the need for the use of high quality, integrated ICT based delivery of careers services; and secondly, the importance of high quality, impartial LMI in careers practice. Both findings have implications for capacity building within and across the careers workforce, as well as the development of a robust technology infrastructure to deliver online services. The example from British Columbia, Canada, is worthy of special note regarding the integrated online services, providing a template for delivery, moving forward. Regarding the use of LMI, the research being carried out by Warwick Institute for Employment Research, through funding from the UK Commission for Employment and Skills, promises a breakthrough in accessibility to high quality, robust LMI databases for careers guidance. There is scope for a steer to be provided by the Economy Committee in the exploitation of this web tool, which is due for stage one release at the end of May 2013.

5.6 There is a need for targeted support for groups identified by the Committee including the 50+, low paid workers and parents (including those returning to work and lone parents). Research findings on careers guidance services for disabled people are generally minimalist. Examples of practice in this paper provide concrete examples of how these groups' needs can be better met.

5.7 Careers services should be allowed the flexibility to innovate and develop more effective and personalised services beyond a narrow set of key performance indicators.

5.8 Findings from the Careers Profession Taskforce in England (2011)¹²⁷ provide a framework for strengthening the careers profession and capacity building within local communities across London. There is a case for London to promote quality standards around levels of qualification of career practitioners and continuing professional development requirements. The formation of a new Career Development Institute¹²⁸, bringing together four long standing professional associations from public, private and voluntary/community sectors, creates a new opportunity for greater capacity building of career development practitioners and allied workers across London¹²⁹.

5.9 The existing requirement to meet the matrix Standard for adult careers IAG currently applies to all NCS prime and sub-contractors. It needs to be established as a more prominent benchmark, possibly alongside other quality kitemarks to encourage private providers to engage with quality assurance and thereby build consumer confidence in the services offered.

5.10 There are few robust studies of evidence on city-wide to enable concrete conclusions to be drawn on the impact of different models and approaches on adults' attainment, progression and employment prospects, or on other quantifiable success measures. However, there is evidence elsewhere to demonstrate a relationship between clarity of career goals and educational attainment.¹³⁰ There is also a strong theoretical basis for the effect of careers education and guidance on attainment and associated behaviour.¹³¹ This is supported by some US studies on the impact of more broadly-based guidance programmes on pupil performance.¹³²

5.11 Finally, the ongoing work of the International Centre for Career Development and Public Policy (ICCDPP)¹³³, PES to PES dialogue¹³⁴, the European Lifelong Guidance Policy Network (ELGPN)¹³⁵, and Cedefop¹³⁶ provide further strong insights to progress being made on career development systems and services and future prospects.

Dr Deirdre Hughes, OBE

28th March 2013

¹²⁷ Silver, R. (2010) *Careers Profession Taskforce Report: Towards a Stronger Careers Profession - An Independent Report to the Department for Education*, London: Department for Education.

¹²⁸ <https://www.cparegister.org/public/report.aspx?memberqueryid=4AF7BEE0-39EB-4579-8E58-01DA3CFFB06A&atc=aaa&nodeid=18601CA9-2B23-4E52-B480-86AF6BB5C834>

¹²⁹ Links are already established with a new Institute for Employability Practitioners operating in Welfare to Work reforms.

¹³⁰ Inter-Ed (2004). *Career Goals and Educational Attainment: What is the Link?* Glasgow: Careers Scotland.

¹³¹ Killeen, J., Sammons, P. & Watts, A.G. (1999). *The Effects of Careers Education and Guidance on Attainment and Associated Behaviour*. Cambridge: National Institute for Careers Education and Counselling.

¹³² For example, Lapan, R., Gysbers, N. & Sun, Y. (1997). The impact of more fully implemented guidance programs on the school experiences of high school students: a state-wide evaluation study. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 75, 292-302.

¹³³ <http://www.iccdpp.org/Resources/PolicyPoints/tabid/85/Default.aspx>

¹³⁴ <http://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?catId=964>

¹³⁵ <http://ktl.jyu.fi/ktl/elgpn>

¹³⁶ http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/EN/Files/6111_en.pdf

Appendix 1

Key Expert Informants

AUSTRALIA Dr Peter Mc Ilveen, Australia Peter Tatham, Tasmania	Paras. 3.5.2 & 4.4 Paras. 1.18, 3.1.6, 3.3.6 & Case Study 3
CANADA Tannis Goddard, British Columbia, Canada Lynne Bezanson, Canadian Career Development Foundation Sareena Hopkins, Canadian Career Development Foundation	Paras. 3.1.5 & 3.2.2 Paras. 3.2.4 & 3.6.8 Paras. 3.2.4 & 3.6.8
DENMARK Dr Rie Thomson, AARHUS University, Denmark	Para. 1.8
ENGLAND Graham Attwell, Director, Pontydyssgu, Wales	Para. 3.6.3
Joe Billington, Head of NCS, England	Para. 2.11
Professor Jenny Bimrose, Deputy Director, Warwick University IER, England	Paras. 2.5.1, 2.5.2, 2.5.4, 2.6, 3.1., 3.3. & 3.6
Simon Bysshe, Director, SB Associates, England	Paras. 3.4.5 & 3.4.6
Brenda Cabras, Head of London NCS Contract, Prospects, England	Para. 2.11
Kieran Gordon, CEO, Greater Merseyside Connexions	Para. 3.2.3
Liane Hambly, Director, L Hambly Associates	Para.3.6.6
Andrea Lewis Disability Rights UK	Paras. 3.5 & 3.5.1
Moira Mc Kerracher, Senior Director, UK Commission for Employment & Skills	Paras.1.15, 2.5, 2.6 & 2.12
Mark Ravenhall, Director, NIACE, Leicester	Para. 3.3.5
FINLAND Dr. Raimo Vuorinen, Project Co-ordinator European Lifelong Guidance Policy Network, Finnish Institute for Educational Research, Finland	Paras. 3.2.6, 3.2.7, & 3.6.4

GERMANY Karen Schober, IAEVG Board Member, Germany	Para. 3.6.10
HUNGARY Dr Tibor Bors Borbély-Pecze, Public Employment Service, Hungary	Para. 1.8 & Case Study 2
ICELAND Gudborg Vilhjalmsdottir, Assistant Professor in School Counselling, University of Iceland	Para. 2.13
INDIA Dr Gideon Arulmani, clinical psychologist and Director of The Promise Foundation, Bangalore	Para. 3.6.7
IRELAND Jennifer Mc Kenzie, National Guidance Centre for Education, Dublin Ursula Kearney, Guidance Officer, National Guidance Centre for Education, Cork	Para. 3.6.9
NEW ZEALAND John Mc Carthy, International Centre for Career Development and Public Policy	Paras. 1.8 & 3.6.2
SPAIN Pillar Cabello, Euroguidance, Spain	Para. 3.4
SWEDEN Nina Ahlroos, Euroguidance, Sweden	Para. 2.5.3
USA Professor James P. Sampson, Florida State University Professor Scott Solberg, Associate Dean for Research, Boston University	Para. 4.4 Para.4.6

Appendix 2

The UKCES (2011) concluded that the main characteristics of effective approaches to careers service design and delivery included the following key features:

- Multi-channel access (web, telephone, person-to-person) that is well signposted and caters for individuals of all ages, both those entering work or learning and those seeking to change job and progress.
- Sufficient quality assurance to engender confidence in services without disproportionate bureaucracy.
- Optimal use of new technology to widen access to services, enrich the user (and advisor) experience and deliver best value for money.
- Best use of the latest assistive technologies to widen access for people with disabilities.
- Innovation and greater impact encouraged through a range of approaches that includes private/third sector partnerships.
- Careers practitioners confident in using technology who provide the full range of career guidance to support individuals to become more self-sufficient.
- Technology used not only to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of services, but also for developing the competencies needed by career professionals.
- High quality Labour Market Information (LMI) – information about job vacancies, employment trends, job roles, career structures, earnings, etc – available and accessible for advisors, individuals and businesses.
- Developers able to find and use data to develop new products and services where these fill a gap in the market.
- Individuals with digital literacy, information handling and career management skills make best use of online provision.
- Individuals as service users drive change to services and their needs are used to evaluate how the system is working.